Centurion Journal of Multidisciplinary Research

Centurion
UNIVERSITY

Shaping Lives...
Empowering Communities...

centurion university of technology and management

Annual Subscription: Rs 300 (within India) excluding postage charges. Outside India USD 30, excluding postage charges. See website for details.

The designations employed and the presentation of material in the CJMR journal do not imply the expression of an opinion whatsoever on the part of Centurion University of Technology and Management concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

The authors are responsible for the choice and the presentation of the facts contained in the journal and for the opinions expressed therein, which are not necessarily those of Centurion University of Technology and Management.

Centurion Journal of
Multidisciplinary Research

Centurion
UNIVERSITY

Shaping Lives...
Empowering Communities...

CENTURION UNIVERSITY PRESS, ODISHA, INDIA

About the Journal

Centurion Journal of Multi-disciplinary Research

Centurion Journal of Multi-disciplinary Research is a refereed journal, which serves as a platform for exploring the current issues, challenges and linkages in the broad areas of development, technology, engineering and management. There is a special focus on skill development and education, its recognition and promotion in the country, especially with the 'Make in India' initiative by the government of India. The objective of the journal is to facilitate bringing together research based contributions in science, technology, management and skills that has direct implication for the development of under-privileged communities and empowering them. The journal links theory and practice in the above areas so as to have policy and programme implications, particularly in under-developed contexts. In addition to articles from individuals or collectives, the journal publishes book reviews.

Aims and Scope of CJMR

CJMR is a multi-disciplinary, refereed journal serving as a forum for exploring theoretical and empirical understanding in the broad areas of development, management, science and technology. Perspective building in the area of skill development and education is another area which the journal would like to promote.

Centurion Journal of Multi-disciplinary Research aims at:

- Providing a platform for debate and dissemination of research findings, conceptual developments and new research areas and techniques that promise to change analyses and perspectives on science and technology, development, management, skill in developing societies;
- Disseminating and promoting research, good practice and innovation in all aspects of science, technology, management and skill development to its main audiences, including educators, researchers, graduate students, policy makers, and practitioners; and
- Encouraging multi-disciplinary cooperation and understanding, and enhancing quality research.

Editorial

Each of the United Nations' 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) has a special relevance for the world's 500 million indigenous people. They are arguably among the world's poorest and most alienated from the public decision making. The SDGs can potentially provide an enabling environment to enhance the well-being of indigenous population. For that it needs to be aligned with other instruments like the UN Declaration on the Rights of the Indigenous Peoples. What is observed is that most post-colonial democratic nations, there are policies and constitutional provisions to protect the indigenous people. Within those provisions, the indigenous people are allowed to maintain and strengthen their distinct political, legal, economic, social and cultural institutions. Further, they can choose to participate in the political, economic and social life of the state. Despite the policies and affirmative actions, the indigenous people continue to be deprived, living in abject poverty in many parts of the world including India. Tribals in India can be referred to as indigenous people. In India, many scholars are of the view that the purported social protection policies of tribal population have further complicated issues relating to their rights.

This issue is a collection of a few papers presented in the Conference 'Narrativising Indigeneity: Looking to the Future' organised by Centurion University of Technology and Management in collaboration with Deakin University (Australia) and Indira Gandhi Centre for Arts (New Delhi), 24-27 Feb 2016, at Parlakhemundi.

Indigeneity India is to do with the identity of the tribal population and like its near synonym 'aboriginality' forms an abstract noun from 'indigenous people'. It is contingent upon historical and situational specificities and cannot be captured within one nomothetic definition. Tribals in India are invariably referred to as the autochthonous (first occupants of the land), having collective rights, self-determination with fairly egalitarian social relations. Indigeneity, over the years has strong

implications for political and legal assertions by the tribal people. Conflict with the state and its dominant populace is an outcome of these assertions. Market economy has successfully commodified indigeneity (art and artefacts), but not done enough to alleviate the conditions of the indigenous people. They continue to remain exploited and marginalised.

Dev Nathan's paper discusses how the tribals in India retain what they value as their identity even while they are part of market-based development. The paper also provides pointers to ways of combining collective forms of enterprise by the indigenous people with market-based development. The legitimacy of narrativising indigeneity is questioned by Binod Agarwal in his paper, where there is a continuous and evolving interaction among tribes and castes. He proposes an alternative framework, in which the emphasis is on linguistic structures, referred to as emic approach in Anthropology. Nicholas Lakra in his paper has dwelt on digital divide and exclusion of indigenous people in the era of globalisation. He proposes that there is a need to address social exclusion, lack of media outreach and ICT infrastructure to make the indigenous people included in the economy of the country. Similarly, Annapurna Pandey in her paper has illustrated the interface between globalisation and indigeneity. She has used the voice of a tribal women presented in a narrative form on how she could successfully meet her aspirations provided to her in neo-liberal India. Community Radio has a great potential to reach out to the indigenous people, especially those living in remote locations. This is the focus of R. Sreedhar's paper in which relevant information can reach the indigenous people preferably in their language. Further, it can potentially facilitate in cultural integration of the tribal people to make them feel included. Kishore Tripathy's paper examines the role of world heritage and indigenous people for protection of cultural diversity and inter-culturality. In this the indigenous worldview and values for sustainable indigenous development of world heritage settlements, conservation and safeguarding of tangible and intangible cultural heritage dimensions are focussed on.

Dr. Smita Mishra Panda
Professor

Contents

Scheduled Tribes: Market-based Development and Identity

Dev Nathan[1]

Abstract

Indigenous societies should explore ways of combining collective forms of enterprise with market-based development. This would help preserve or even develop values of collectivity, and gender and other equality. Simultaneously it would be necessary to see how to fashion a social analysis that starts from the position of human beings being one species among others that too have agency, even if not to the same extent as humans. Such a shift in thinking is necessary to be able to deal with the problems of the local and global environments that human interventions have caused. This short paper is an attempt at trying to see what scope there is for the scheduled tribes (STs), adivasis or indigenous peoples to retain what they value as their identity even while they are part of market-based development.[1]

---

[1] An earlier version of this note was delivered as the Sankaran Memorial Lecture at NIRD, Hyderabad in 2014.

---

1. Institute for Human Development, India, Center on Globalization, Governance and Competitiveness (CGGC), Duke University, USA

Introduction: Development and Inequality

A complaint that one often hears when working with development projects among indigenous peoples in various parts of Asia is that their values are being lost in the process of development. Programmes and projects among the STs promote different forms of market-based development. A shift from cultivation for self-consumption to cultivation for the market, an intensification of cultivation so that marketable surpluses can be produced, the collection and sale of non-timber forest products (NTFP) – these are some of the ways in which development is promoted among the STs.

Of course, such development is predicated upon the state's acceptance of certain rights of the adivasis – their property rights, whether individual or collective, over lands; their access to forests for collection of NTFP; and their rights to NTFP and minor minerals, such as sand or stone. These rights have been accepted, even if imperfectly and with a lot of bureaucratic hurdles, under the Forest Rights Act (FRA) and PESA. Without such security of rights intensification of cultivation would be virtually impossible. At times, however, such security may be more de facto than de jure.

More recently, migration to work in cities, or even to the Green Revolution areas of North-west India, have also emerged as important avenues for income increases. The setting up of states such as Jharkhand, also led to a construction boom, a book which has trickled down to smaller towns. In fact, during the course of a poverty strategy study of Jharkhand for the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD), the IHD study team found that commuting migration to nearby urban centres for work in construction had replaced NTFP collection as the main source of cash income.

But these developments, while they have increased income of the STs have also brought certain negative developments with them. Not all benefit equally from the new opportunities. Those who get government

or other regular jobs do much better. Those with more family members who migrate also do better. Those with more valley-bottom land, on which rice can be followed by vegetables, also do better. Overall, inequality has increased and eroded collective identities.

There have also been reactions to the increases in inequality. Recent case studies of witch persecution show that inequalities and jealousy have appeared as factors in witch denunciations. Police data, which are underestimates of witch events, show that the numbers of those killed have increased after the formation of the state of Jharkhand. There is reported to have been a similar development after the end of apartheid in South Africa.

What Is Identity?

Given the growth of inequality in the course of development that has occurred, and the concern with indigenous culture, we need to start with the question what is identity? Some may argue that identity is a particular way of life, say, that of hunter-gatherers or swidden cultivators. It could also be taken as the use of certain technologies, such as hoe or plough cultivation. This would be a kind of technological determinism of identities.

There are certainly many correspondences between ways of life, technology and identity. People think of what they do as being their identity. And what they do is very much related to the technology they use. But it is not as though there is a one-to-one relation between technology and identity. Very similar rice cultivation is carried out, for instance, by peasants in India and China. Of course, there is also a very broad similarity in that these rice cultivation regions, have been the sites where states have come into being. They are also regions where patriarchy has been built. But within this broad bush historical similarity there are many differences of culture.

Further, it is also true that we live in a time of change and, that too, rapid change. Some livelihoods that do not provide adequate means of livelihood are being given up in favour of others that secure or at least promise higher returns. For instance, many adivasis are taking up jobs, often in government service or the public sector, but also elsewhere. Urban centres were not part of traditional adivasis ways of life, but now are very much part of it.

Do those who have become urbanized or taken up jobs and given up farming of any kind, do they, therefore, cease to be adivasi? I doubt if anyone would argue in favour of denying that such persons or families continue to be adivasi.

What then constitutes adivasi identity? I would suggest that identity in this context should be taken to mean what could be called the core values of a society or community. One could suggest that the following constitute core values of adivasi communities: a value for the collective, as against the individualism of the market; a belief system (animism) that is based on the culture-nature continuum, rather than the culture-nature binary that is characteristic of market societies; and a somewhat less unequal position of women, based on men not dominating all the hierarchies in the family and community.

If we take the position that identity is constituted by the core values that a community or tribe generally accepts, then the question of identity in contemporary development becomes: can these core values be maintained even while undertaking market-based development?

Alternatives in Development

In placing the alternatives in development, I modify the 2x2 matrix used by Hirschman (1982) in discussing approaches to the development of capitalism.[2]

Figure 1: Development Alternatives

	Positive Effects	**Negative Effects**
Market-based Development	**A** Specialization, scale and learning increase productivity, income and well-being	**B** Nature-culture binary; Depletion of resources and destruction of cultures; Growing inequality and male domination
Influential Presence of Indigenous Forms	**D** Nature-culture continuum; Preserving resources and culture; Limiting both inequality and male domination	**C** Norms that inhibit accumulation and individual initiative

---

2   This section is based on Nathan, et al., 2012.

We compare two development paths, one of 'market-based development' and the other with an 'influential presence of indigenous forms'. Since traditional systems have been substantially modified, it would be difficult to think of any tribal system as being completely indigenous; which is why, I use the term 'substantial presence of indigenous forms'.

Each of these two development paths has both positive and negative effects. In quadrant [A], the case of market-based development, there are shown the possible benefits of specialization and large-scale production, increasing productivity and both higher income and improved well-being. The negative effects, shown in quadrant [B], are the hegemonic ideology of the nature-culture binary, which is also related to the notion of human domination of nature. Other negative effects are the destruction of cultures, along with growing inequality and male domination.

The ideology of the indigenous forms-influenced path, in quadrant [D], continues to retain the notion of nature-culture continuum, where all living beings, and even non-living substances are thought to embody a spirit, or, in other words, to have some form of agency. Not being dominated by the market, resources and cultures could both be preserved; while there is limited inequality and limited male domination. On the negative side, however, in [C] indigenous forms inhibit both accumulation and individual initiative.

Each of these quadrants contains an element of truth; but they cannot be held in isolation from each other. The horizontal quadrants go together with each other; at present, two sides of a coin. Along with [A] there is also [B]; the market not only as enabling but also destructive. Supporters of the market often point to [A], its enabling character; but ignore [B] the destructive side of the market. Similarly, those who uphold indigenous forms point to [D]; but tend to ignore [C], the negative side of inhibiting accumulation and individual development.

In a similar fashion, there tend to beliefs across the diagonals. Those who hold [A], of the income and well-being benefits of market society, also hold [C], of the inhibiting effects of indigenous beliefs on

accumulation and individual initiative. On the other hand, those who point to [B] the devastating effects of market-based development on nature and culture, uphold [D] the beneficial effects of indigenous belief systems based on the human-nature continuum, limitations to inequality and restricted male domination.

Alternative Modernities?

The interesting question is: can the two sets of verticals exist together? Could there be a society organized on indigenous beliefs against accumulation that is also destructive of nature and resources? All production related to nature necessarily transforms it; which is why we talk of the co-evolution of humans and nature. But can such production, without accumulation, nevertheless destroy, in a significant way, nature? Yes, this has often happened in indigenous societies. Swidden cultivators-cum-gatherers are known to shift their location when some critical wild, i.e. uncultivated, foods or materials become scarce; or, when the productivity of cultivation goes down because of the depletion of top soil. There are also the dramatic examples of the North Indian hunter-gatherers who, in the pre-colonial or pre-Columbian period, had already hunted mega fauna to extinction.

So, there have been combinations of [C] and [B], with indigenous norms that inhibit accumulation co-existing with the depletion of resource and even the extinction of some species. Of course, the scale of the depletion and extinction are both quite different from what we see now in the Anthropocene (Steffen et al, 2011), but depletion and extinction did occur through the actions of indigenous societies.

What about the co-existence of [A] and [C]? Can there be an accumulative community or village that secures the benefits of specialization, increases productivity and yet simultaneously sustains beliefs in the nature-culture continuum and preserves resources? Also a market-based production system limits inequality and even proceeds towards gender quality?

This is the type of issue posed by the approach of alternative modernities. As Bhargava points out, there is a need for "the recognition

of alternative modernities that lie unnoticed because of the hold on our imagination of a simplistic, dichotomous framework that bifurcates our world into western modernity and indigenous tradition" (2012: 311). For modernity we can substitute the economic equivalent of a market-based or capitalist economy. Are there alternatives possible, other than the dichotomies of market-based and indigenous forms?

Let us first take the question of inequality, including gender inequality. To begin with, communities can relate to the market in more than one way. The usual way of dealing with the market is on an individual basis, with each individual or household selling on and buying from the market in an atomized manner. Such individualized market behaviour is often competitive, as each seller tries to secure a market or maximize her sales. This, for instance, was noticed among suppliers of horse-rides as tourism services among the indigenous peoples of Yunnan in China. Initially all households competed with each other and brought down prices. Over time, however, they learned that combining and rotating the provision of horse-rides would enable them to sustain prices and thus their incomes.

These are small-scale examples of suppliers from indigenous communities combining to control supply and thus prevent a 'race to the bottom' in prices and income. There are bigger examples of whole villages in China that have remained collective while they operate in the market (Nathan and Kelkar, 1997). There are many village-owned Township and Village Enterprises (TVEs) in China and a few collective villages. Instead of distributing profits as dividends to a handful of share-owners, the profits are either accumulated or used to provide basic facilities such as housing, education, medical care and even food to all members of the village collective. Of course, there are strict rules about discipline at work and those who try to 'free ride' are punished. These collective villages in China also have a reasonably good record in reducing gender inequality. Some of the village leaders and factory managers are women and many women are skilled workers.

Among some North American indigenous peoples too collective enterprises have been set up. It has been called a form of 'indigenous

capitalism', where profits do not become the private income of a few but are shared among all owners.

What these examples show is that it is possible to have collectively-owned villages as enterprises that operate in a market system. As far as buying and selling operations on the market, the type of enterprise does not matter. An enterprise could be individually owned, be a joint-stock enterprise, a cooperative or even a collective. All such enterprises, irrespective of their internal forms of organization, can operate in the market. But to remain in operation within the market, enterprises will have to continue to earn a profit and carry out at least, the investments that are necessary to take account of depreciation and equipment replacement requirements. In an increasingly competitive world economy they would also have to invest in increasing productivity or in innovation so as not to fall behind competitors.

Adivasi communities too could set up similar collective enterprises to conduct their market economic relations. Such enterprises would have to overcome collective action problems and establish discipline among members. Besides cooperative, Indian company law also provides for the setting up of what is called "worker owned companies", where only those who work in a company can be share-holders.

Forming collective enterprises is then a way in which problems of income inequality and gender inequality could be dealt with. But what about the questions of the relationship with nature and that of the preservation of resources to make production sustainable? These are more difficult questions, since it means moving away from a short-term and a purely instrumentalist approach to nature. This is a challenge the world as a whole faces, as we come to grips with the geological changes (global warming, extinction of species, etc.) that humans have created in the Anthropocene.

Dealing with these problems at both global and local levels requires a change in mindset, in culture, and analysis in the approach to nature. From seeing nature simply as a resource, we have to recognize that whatever is created is the result of human-nature interaction, and that

in the course of interaction, there is a co-evolution of both humans and nature.

The indigenous peoples can be aware of their co-evolutionary relationship with forests. In addition, their traditional world-views start from the inter-relationship between all species, all living beings, and even of relationship between living and non-living objects. In a way that standard market-based thinking does not, indigenous thinking acknowledges that human beings are just one species among many, and the inter-relations of species do not have to be those of domination.

Moving away from a dominating view of nature to one of acknowledging inter-relationships and agency of non-humans is a big step. While the world as a whole has still to fashion ways of thinking in this manner, indigenous spirit-based animism does have some pointers in this matter. Of course, it is a long way in actually being able to analyze problems in this way, but a beginning can be made.

To conclude, I would like to say that indigenous societies should explore ways of combining collective forms of enterprise with market-based development. This would help preserve or even develop values of collectivity, and gender and other equality. Simultaneously it would be necessary to see how to fashion a social analysis that starts from the position of human beings being one species among others that too have agency, even if not to the same extent as humans. Such a shift in thinking is necessary to be able to deal with the problems of the local and global environments that human interventions have caused.

References

Bhargava, R. (2012). *What is Political Theory and Do We Need Political Theory?* New Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Hirschman, A. (1982). 'Rival Interpretations of Market Society: Civilizing, Destructive or Feeble?' *Journal of Economic Literature,* 20 (4): 1463 – 84.

Nathan, D., & Kelkar, G. (1997). Collective Villages in the Chinese Market-II. *Economic and Political Weekly,* 1037-1047.

Nathan, Dev, Kelkar, G, Thapa, G. & Cordone, A. (2012). *Markets and Indigenous Peoples in Asia: Lessons from Development Projects*, New Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Steffen, W., Grinevald, J., Crutzen, P., & McNeill, J. (2011). The Anthropocene: conceptual and historical perspectives. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering Sciences*, 369(1938), 842-867.

British Colonial Colossal Blunder: Narrativising Indigeneity of the Scheduled Tribes now Adivasi in India

Binod C Agrawal[1]

Abstract

After India's Independence from the yoke of British Colonialism, the new rulers of Independent India decided to continue to follow almost all rules framed by the British Imperial Power for control, subjugation and suppression of the "natives" (read the citizens) of almost two third of British India. In India, about one hundred fifty years ago in 1871, having professed best intentions enumerated the population, British rulers classified a part of the population, whom they thought, were indigenous inhabitants of India. The remaining population was considered as outsiders and migrants within one linguistic region to another or from Central and Western Asia and Europe. No doubt, historical evidences exist of continuous emigration as late as twentieth century in the country.

1. The author is farmer Professor of Eminence and Director General TALEEM Research Foundation City Plaza, Bopal, Ahmedabad 38008. Future address of communication: 8 ISRO Complex Sector D-1 Sterling City, Bopal Ahmedabad 380058, E-mail: agrawal.binod.c@gmail.com.

Introduction

The current debate taken up by several scholars and anthropologists is about such a classification of a section of the Indian population as "tribes." Ghurye (1963) questioned the classification and categorization of tribes and castes. British Administrators in India, like elsewhere, often referred Tribes as 'The Aborigines'.

Independent India came into existence on August 15, 1947. Simultaneously Pakistan was created as another independent country after the partition of undivided India. Creation of two countries was a brain child of British Imperial power on the basis of religion. In 1971, Pakistan was further divided into Bangladesh and Pakistan. The British classification of tribe and caste has been incorporated in all three countries in one form or other. The Constitution of India under Article 366 (25) in accordance with Article 342 listed the names of the Scheduled Tribes and has had several revisions since the adoption of the Constitution. The Scheduled Tribes as mentioned in the Constitution of India are popularly known as '*Adivasi*'. Today, an average Scheduled Tribe living in any part of India identifies himself/herself as Adivasi and these Scheduled Tribes among themselves also refer to each other as *Adivasi*. The term *Adivasi* is a new identity and is being used as a socio-economic and political category by local officials, laypersons, politicians, policymakers and administrators alike.

Ghurye (1963) in his book *The Scheduled Tribes* clearly brought out the unending confusions - who are and were Scheduled Tribes in the Indian Civilization. It must be mentioned that there are references about inhabitants in remote and forest areas in ancient literature along with other inhabitants of India.

The British blunder and confusion about who are Scheduled Tribes continue to haunt a large number of Anthropologists, scholars, political leaders and administrators alike, as it has taken socio-political and on many occasions religious connotation having serious economic and political ramifications in Independent India. Since India is a Welfare State, it is committed and has the responsibility for the socio-economic development of all citizens with equality and equity. Despite affirmative

action in favor of Scheduled Tribes and with the help of Constitutional provisions after almost seven decades of independence, desirable levels of development are yet to be achieved. It is pertinent to mention that the Scheduled Tribes and other populations in India have been living in an interactive symbiotic relationship and remained interdependent on each other for variety of goods and services from time immemorial (Agrawal 1977, 1995, 2016). On a broader geographical and political canvas, the same can be said about Bangladesh and Pakistan or for that matter Myanmar, where to a large extent British colonial blunders were repeated or partially accepted. For example, in Bangladesh, the so-called tribes were recognized as Scheduled Tribes based on the historical association of similar names of Scheduled Tribes of North East region of India who largely follow Theravada Buddhism and few who have accepted Christianity. It all happened after 1971, when Bangladesh achieved its independence. In the case of Pakistan, terms like tribes or Scheduled Tribes have not been mentioned in their official documentation, though there are references in the official records of British colonial history about tribes. It seems, to a large extent, Pakistan got rid of the colonial hang-up and used "caste" groups for designating socially identifiable groups regardless of their religion. For example, there are "Mochi Hindu" and "Mochi Muslim" or "Agrawal" in the Census of Pakistan.

The reason for labouring on this issue is to correct the historical blunder made by British colonial rulers. It is for this reason that cultural history must be narrativised and indigenised to correct the perspective. The term narrativising has no dictionary meaning per say, but has meant to reflect, understand and portray those social groups who are being discussed, described and interpreted for others. Recently, a National Conference to narrativising literary expression in North East Region of India was held in September 2013 at Aizawl. Several authors presented their work to discuss the degree to which indigenised perspective was reflected in the literature largely written by scholars from the North East Region. The question raised in the conference were : whether narrativising indigeneity is possible in the backdrop of British colonial concept like tribe as a 'social group' or 'ethnic group' in the Civilization of India? Is it possible that narrativising indigeneity

in tribes in its colonial content and essence, was later adopted and incorporated in the Constitution of India as Scheduled Tribes? At the same time, narrativising indigeneity for the true reflection of Scheduled Tribes after Independence into civilization of India popularly referred to as "mainstream" has been extremely complex and difficult task "…given the varied conditions under which they [Scheduled Tribes] live in different parts of the country, and their different languages and distinct cultures" (Chandra, Mukherjee and Mukherjee 2000: 106). Should a similar question be raised for the whole of India?

Observations and a large number of field researches support the view that Scheduled Tribes in spite of their remote living continued to interact with the rest of neighbouring Hindu castes and other religious groups (Agrawal 1977). Notwithstanding the controversy, it is sufficed to say that the Constitution of India under Article 330 has recognized Scheduled Tribes as a separate social category who are considered as a socially, economically and technologically deprived group. After a lapse of more than two hundred years, India has witnessed major economic, political, social, technological and methods of governance. Therefore, the question is in which time frame should one consider narrativising indigeneity? Can principles incorporated in the Constitution of India and enunciated provisions of reservation of seats in Central, State and Union Territory apart from reservation in education and job and other facilities to uplift and bring Scheduled Tribes into mainstream, be re-examined after narrativising indigeneity of the Indian Civilization?.

Scheduled Tribes of Gujarat: A Case of Narrativising Indigeneity

Scheduled Tribes of Gujarat inhabit 11 eastern districts of Gujarat adjoining three states of Rajasthan, Madhya Pradesh and Maharashtra having concentration of Bhil on their borders. Therefore, some of the observations made for Gujarat are applicable to Bhil Scheduled Tribes of three neighboring states. There has been rapid industrialization in several districts of Gujarat largely inhabited by Scheduled Tribes including Bhil along with castes and other religious groups.

According to the Census of India 2011, there are 8.91 million Scheduled Tribes comprising 14.8 percent of the total population Gujarat largely living in fringe and rural areas. There are 25 Scheduled Tribes in the State of Gujarat in which five are listed as most primitive Scheduled Tribes. These are Kotwalita, Kolga, Kathodi, Siddi and Padhar (Upadhyaya and Pancholi 2010). The other major Scheduled Tribes include the Bhil, Dubla, Dhodia, Rathwa, Kokna, Varli, Gamit and Nayak. Bhil is the largest Scheduled Tribe comprising almost 46.01 percent of the total Scheduled Tribes population in Gujarat. Same is the case of Bhil population in the neighboring States of Rajasthan, Madhya Pradesh and Maharashtra constituting second largest Scheduled Tribes in India.

Exceptions apart, Scheduled Tribes live in mixed habitations along with other castes, and other religious groups. For the discussion, I will now refer to them as non-Scheduled Tribes. Also, there has been continuous internal migration and displacement of Scheduled Tribes due to geo-political, economic and natural disasters from one region to another in different parts of India. Added to it has been flux of immigrants from other states who have encroached and occupied lands of Scheduled Tribes.

For example, after the creation of the State of Gujarat in 1961, an additional problem, for the displacement of Scheduled Tribes and non-Scheduled Tribes have been fast paced industrialization and urbanization. This process has enhanced interdependence and social interaction between Scheduled Tribes and non-Scheduled Tribes.

In an anthropological field study carried out in five villages in Bharuch District Gujarat during July-August 2012[1], provided a picture of interactive pattern between Scheduled Tribes and non-Scheduled Tribes.

The five villages under study represented microcosm of the macrocosm of tribal Gujarat. As much as 90.6 per cent Scheduled Tribes and non-Scheduled Tribes claimed to be Hindu along with 9.4 per cent Muslim. No significant economic differences were observed between Scheduled Tribes and non-Scheduled Tribes. There were marginal or no differences between Scheduled Tribes and non-Scheduled Tribes life and livelihood styles, almost all of them had access to major sources of drinking water through pipeline in their houses and were electrified. Like non-Scheduled Tribes, the Scheduled Tribes owned a large number of consumer goods like bed mattress, electric fan, electronic watch/wall clock and chair in their houses. In addition, Scheduled Tribes have acquired pressure cooker, television, telephone/mobile phone, scooter/motor cycle and some of them even have refrigerator thereby showing Scheduled Tribes' eagerness to adopt and accept change like their counterpart non-Scheduled Tribes. The Scheduled Tribes in Gujarat have been able to make economic advancement as a group.

Thought for Action Consideration

The brief profile of the households tends to support the view that little or no differences existed between Scheduled Tribes and non-Scheduled Tribes in five villages under study in Gujarat. The comparative study tends to point out that interdependence and interaction has been a continuous process over of period though no major generalization can be drawn from a small study. However, it raises doubt whether narrativising indigeneity would be legitimate in a continuous and evolving process of interaction in the so called tribes and castes artificially constructed as a descriptive tool or for the purposes of classification.

Hence, it is proposed that there is a need for some other method to be followed for narrativising indigeneity. It should be drawn from the linguistic structures what have been referred to as an emic approach in anthropological literature. Towards that, there is a need for a fresh national linguistic survey of the country which was done at the end of the nineteenth century that too by British colonial administrators to serve their limited purpose of control and revenue collection. In the

recent past, it has been partially attempted. National linguistic survey will throw a large number of *emic* categories that can be helpful to redraw new social and identifiable "community" boundaries and national linguistic map for comparison and narrativising indigeneity in depicting cultural realities. It will also help correct existing distortions inherent in the earlier ethnographic analysis of the Indian civilization and also help in facilitating the reducing inequality, poverty and hunger among the indigenous communities which are some of the goals of the SDGs 2030.

References

Agrawal, Binod C. (1977). Interaction Between Tribes and non-Tribes In *Tribal Heritage of India,* ed., S C Dubey, pp 118-140. New Delhi: Vikas Publishing House Pvt. Ltd.

-         (1995) Anthropology and Tribal Women Workforce in the Industrial Setting of India In *Indian Tribes* (Health Ecology and Social Structure), R C Swarnakar ed.; pp 253-258. Jaipur: Printwell.

-         (2016) Culture, Communication and Health in North East Region An Anthropological Perspective. In *Culture, Health and Development The Situation among the Tribes of North-East India. (*Eds.) Narendra Kh Singh and Binod C Agrawal pp : 3-13. New Delhi: Concept Publishing Company Pvt. Ltd.

Anonymous. (2012). *Land Looser Survey of Dahej Survey. Ahmedabad: TALEEM Research Foundation* (unpublished report prepared by Chandra Gupt Sanon).

Chandra, B, & Mukherjee, Mridula and Mukherjee, A. (1999).*India After Independence: 1947-2000*. New Delhi: Penguin Books India.

Ghurye, G.S. (1963). *The Scheduled Tribes.* Bombay: G.G.Pathare.

Upadhyaya, C. & Pancholi, R. (2010). *Primitive Tribal Groups of Gujarat A Baseline Survey.* Ahmedabad: Tribal Research and Training Institute, Gujarat Vidyapith, Ahmedabad.

Digital Inclusion and Indigenous People

Nicholas Lakra[1]

Abstract

The theme 'Digital Inclusion and Indigenous People' is an important area of social concern in the context of information knowledge and development. Information knowledge is essential for development. Digital inclusion is an ability of individuals and groups to access Information and Communication Technologies (ICT). It paves the way for participation of every individual, group in the rapid economic growth and national development. The recent national programme such as 'Digital India', 'Make in India', etc. have been initiated with the objectives of inclusive growth. How can be inclusive growth attained when the eight per cent of indigenous tribal people who are socially excluded and who are out of mainstream media reach, and lack ICT infrastructure? This paper examines on digital inclusion from indigenous tribal people's perspectives and proposes that the bridging of digital gap is essential in

1. Assistant Professor, Department of Culture and Media Studies, Central University of Rajasthan, NH-8, Bandarsindri, Kishangarh - 305 801, Dist. Ajmer (Rajasthan), INDIA.

order to make inclusive growth. Digital inclusion can be achieved by social inclusion. This paper also discusses the cultural dimension of digital inclusion.

Key words: Digital Inclusion, Indigenous, Tribal, Digital Divide, Inclusive Economy, ICT, Digital India, Make in India.

Introduction

This is the epoch of Information Communication Technology (ICT). In an information society, every individual or group of individuals need to have access to information available through Internet connectivity in order to make progress in society. The SDGs 2030, aims for an inclusive world in which *'no one is left behind'*. There are five ways that ICTs can facilitate in the achievement of SDGs – accelerated upscaling of critical services in health, education, financial services, smart agriculture and low-carbon energy systems (FAO, 2017). Indeed, India is making rapid economic growth with the advancement of Information Communication Technology (ICT). But how its economic growth could be more inclusive, is a concern of building Indian Nation because the country after independence was carved under the socialist model where it had an important social responsibility to the backward and neglected communities (Samata, 2006:498). Underpinning these socialistic objectives, the topic of 'Digital inclusion and indigenous people' aims to examine that Indian State cannot make holistic development unless every section of people, especially the marginalized indigenous and tribal people who are socially excluded from the mainstream economic system, are also empowered and made affordable and capable of using Information Communication Technology. It refers to the reality of digital divide among indigenous tribal segments. The digital divide can be defined as the gap between individuals, households, business and geographical areas at different socio-economic levels with regards to both their opportunities to access ICTs and to their use of the internet for a wide variety of activities (Panda, 2013). Digitally excluded people are unable to participate in the democratic and developmental process of the nation because every information is available digitally through the Internet and to which they are not connected and thus they are unable

to make interaction with three main development mover agents: interaction between government and citizen, and government and business, as well as internal government operations (Sumanjeet 2006: 258). Further, the Sustainable Development Goals 2030, agenda clearly indicate the efforts by both state and non-state agencies to empower the marginalised sections of the society and reduce the existing inequalities (Goal 10). Therefore, the digital exclusion of citizens needs to be mitigated systematically.

Since information is power and it is vital to development, digital inclusion of tribal and indigenous people is very essential. The World Summit on Information Society stresses that 'everyone everywhere should have the opportunity to participate and no one should be excluded from the benefits the Information society offers' (WSIS, 2003:4). Therefore, in the world community at large, as the WSIS states, 'there is common desire and commitment to build a people-centred, inclusive and development-oriented and knowledge, enabling individuals, communities and people to achieve their full potential in promoting their sustainable development and improving their quality of life' (WSIS 2003:1). Therefore, this paper examines how the fast developing country like India can advance inclusive economic growth which is inclusive of indigenous tribal people in particular. In this process, this paper, firstly, in brief, explores the socio-cultural scenario of Indigenous people in India; secondly, examining on how the recent initiatives such as Digital India, Make in India, etc. taken by the present government going to be inclusive of tribal people; and thirdly, this paper attempts to propose some suggestions and areas to concentrate in order to make inclusive of tribal people.

Indigenous People : Indian Scenario

According to the census 2011, indigenous and tribal people constitute 8.6 per cent of total population, out of which 8.6 per cent, 11.3 per cent of the tribal population reside in rural setting and mere 2.8 per cent in urban setting. There are about 700 tribal groups, each one is unique and distinct from one another. The Articles 342 and 366 (25) of the Indian Constitution define this section of people as 'Scheduled

Tribes'. The constitutional term 'Schedule Tribe' is an administrative one. However, it is taken for granted that the Schedule Tribes are the indigenous, the original settlers who are also referred to as *Adivasis* in India. For the administrative purpose, Indian constitution defines most tribal concentrated areas as 'Schedule Areas'. Accordingly, Article 244 of the constitution, the tribal populated 'Schedule Areas' include the States of Andhra Pradesh, Jharkhand, Chhattisgarh, Himachal Pradesh, Madhya Pradesh, Gujarat, Maharashtra, Orissa and Rajasthan. The Article 244 (2) provides the 'Sixth Schedule Areas' which include the States of Assam, Meghalaya, Tripura, Manipur, Nagaland Arunachal Pradesh and Mizoram. These Constitutional provisions of Fifth and Sixth Schedule guarantee tribal people to have their rights over land, forest and natural resources. These Schedules are historical guarantees implying undoing the historical injustice done to the tribals by colonialism and feudalism.

a) Socio-economic Status of Tribals

Tribal people are the marginalised groups of the Indian society. However, all tribal groups are not equal in socio-economic status. Some individuals and groups are in a better position economically. However, all tribal groups face some common problems. Land alienation is the most crucial to all the tribal groups. Displacement and land alienation pose serious threats to tribal communities in Schedule Areas (Samta, Mines, 2006: 499). More than 85% of the tribals live in abject poverty. Many of them seasonally migrate to other States in search of employment. Due to poverty, they become prey to moneylenders and are exploited. Tribal literacy is very low. It is 58.96 per cent in India (Census 2011).

The marginalized socio-economic status of the tribals indicate that they are the disadvantaged sections in the Indian society. These indicators also determine their social exclusion in Indian society because, as Ellen points out, "Indicators of social exclusion tend to focus on those important aspects of an individual's life that are associated with their health, wellbeing and general quality of life. They are closely associated with socio-economic status and often indicate a lack of material and/or social resources" (Helsper, 2008: 18). Their disadvantaged and marginalized situation is largely due to discrimination at social and

institutional level that happened during colonial and post-independent era" (Thakur, 2012:15).

Tribals, practice subsistence economy as opposed to the mainstream market economy. They are self-sufficient, self-excluded and do not feel the need to have contact with the non-tribal population. One main reason for their self- exclusion is to safeguard their cultural identity as they are apprehensive about assimilation into the non-tribal dominant Indian society. According to Thakur, exclusion of tribal society is due to the fact that the other part of the society, the Hindu majority, considers them unsuitable to be part of the mainstream society (2012:16). Thus,

"Tribal groups are excluded groups because they are not a part of the greater traditional Hindu society. At best they may be termed as the parallel segments in a different domain. Scheduled Castes, on the contrary, a part and parcel of the greater Hindu society, are excluded as neglected parts thereof" (Thakur 2012: 17).

Tribals are also culturally alienated in Indian society. Cultural survival is a major concern among tribal communities. Culture includes tradition and language. Tribal groups have their own distinct languages, traditions and indigenous knowledge. These intangible heritages of tribal societies are endangered today.

b) Media and Information Exclusion

Tribal and indigenous people suffer not only socio-economic exclusion and cultural alienation but also media and information exclusion. A research study shows that the mainstream media represent only 0.90 per cent of tribal stories. The inadequate representation in media results negatively on development and cultural survival of tribal people (Lakra, 2010: 371). The Indian media is mostly urban-centric whereas tribal people primarily inhabit rural hinterlands. Since the Indian media is urban-centric, it leaves 840 million Indians 'Below Media Line' (BML). The tribal communities live in the remotest parts of the country. They live in such territories, which are surrounded by hills, mountains, rivers, lakes, streams, islands, etc. Such landscapes work as a natural barrier to communication. The remotest tribal areas in India are not electrified.

They are completely cut off from the electronic and print media (Jhon, 2005: 56). Consequently, they are devoid of any information that should matter to them as citizens of the country.

The media and information exclusion indicate that the digital divide is quite alarming in the context of the tribal development. Since tribals are socio-economically and politically weaker sections of the society, media coverage about them is always inadequate. Media representation is a struggle for power and struggle for meaning. Some individuals or groups have more power than others within the communicative process (Jhon 2005: 56-59), therefore they obtain more exposure, legitimacy, and more positive news coverage than do the rest of people (Altheide, 1985: 11). All these factors matter with regard to digital inclusion of indigenous people in an era of *Information Society* because *Digital Inclusion* is concerned with inequalities since some people are unable to access and afford Information Communication Technologies (Jane Seale: 2009: 3).

Digital Economy and Digital Inclusion of Indigenous People: An Analysis

India is advancing digital economy with the advancement of Information Communication Technology (ICT) and is moving from cash-based economy to non-cash or paperless or digital economy (planetfinanceindia.org). Since, the core of digital economy is market economy and e-governance with Information Communication Technology, how is change going to be inclusive of indigenous people who suffer marginalization in information, digital divide and inadequate representation in the country's media? Internet connectivity is the most essential for digital economy. The present government has initiated 'Digital India', 'Make in India', 'Start-up India', etc. as some measures to facilitate India's economic advancement. The following section discusses the potential of digital inclusion of tribals in the country.

Digital India and Digital Inclusion of Tribals

As already mentioned, India is making rapid economic progress with the application of Information Communication Technology. In the process

of accelerating economic progress in order to meet the aspirations of all its citizens, the present government has initiated programmes for promoting 'Digital India'. It is called as a new umbrella initiative. It means,

'Digital India' is an initiative to integrate the government departments and the people of India. It aims at ensuring the government services made available to citizens electronically by reducing paperwork. The initiative also includes plan to connect rural areas with high-speed internet networks. Digital India has three core components. These include creation of digital infrastructure, delivering services digitally and digital literacy' (Kapoor, 2015).

With initiating 'Digital India', the government aims to transform India into a digitally empowered society and knowledge economy by leveraging IT as a growth engine of New India (pib.nic.in/newsite). The main objective of the programme is to create jobs and promote business entrepreneurship. It aims to enhance e-governance in which harnessing of information technology is used to improve the efficiency of the executive function of government including the delivery of public service (Sumanjeet 2006:258). Essentially, there are four e-governance models: (1) Government to citizens (G2C), (2) Government to government (G2G), (3) Government to employees (G2E), and (4) Government to business (G2B) (Kapoor, 2015). How are these models going to be actualised in tribal areas in the absence of essential core components of digital infrastructure and digital literacy without which delivering services digitally is not possible? E-governance cannot reach to the tribal groups. In order to make digital inclusion a success, bridging the digital gap is vital. Low literacy rate, education on Information Communication Technology and working knowledge of English languages are the barriers of digital divide in the tribal scenario. Since digital inclusion is an ability and affordability to harness the Information Communication Technology, the concept of 'Digital India' can be a practical reality among the indigenous people when they are made affordable such as infrastructure and by developing skill for harnessing e-governance through accessing internet. In other words, in order to reach e-governance, the five pillars (5-Cs) of e-governance: Computer, Connectivity, Content, Consumer, and Confidence building (Sumanjeet,

2006: 858) have to be implemented and strengthened among tribal communities in their locations. In the tribal context, implementing the five pillars of e-governance means: equipping and teaching them with hardware and software (Computers), information carriers system (Connectivity), making available of information relevant to them (Content), access and uses of content (Consumer), and taking the measure that helps the tribal citizens develop a confidence in the e-governance and encourage them to adopt e-transformation (Sumanjeet, 2006:858).

There is a strong association between digital inclusion and social exclusion (Seale, 2009:10). Social exclusion results in digital exclusion. Social exclusion results in poverty and low literacy due to which they are unable to afford the infrastructure, access and use the Information Communication Technology. Therefore, in order to make digital inclusion, social inclusion is essential. Digital inclusion is located in social structure (Seale, 2009:22). Unless the indicators of social exclusion are remedied, digital inclusion of tribals is unlikely to take place. Unless, the socio-economically marginalized tribals are empowered, the programmes of digital economy will not bring changes in tribal lives and communities. The aim of digital India is to transform the country into a digitally empowered society. Further, a knowledge economy can be established, when the marginalised sections are empowered to use e-governance. It is likely that those groups with limited access will be outpaced by those who are ahead in the ability to select and process information. Subsequently, digital exclusion will become a new form of social exclusion (Yu Cheung, 2009:755). Therefore, digital inclusion of tribals in reality is concerned with addressing inequalities and social exclusion.

'Make in India' and digital inclusion of tribals

The 'Make in India' programme has been designed to transform India into a global manufacturing hub. It aims to boost the domestic manufacturing industry and attract foreign investors to invest into the Indian economy. It focuses on creating jobs and skill enhancement in 25 sectors such as automobiles, aviation, chemicals, construction, defence manufacturing, electrical machinery, food processing, textiles and

garments, ports, leather, media and entertainment, mining, tourism, railways, mining, thermal power, roads and highways and electronics systems (mindxmaster.com), etc.

Digital inclusion is oriented towards inclusive economic development. The 'Make in India' programme is an important initiative towards economic development. But how much will it prove inclusive from tribal perspective? Will 'Make in India' benefit or affect tribals' lives? The focus areas of 'Make in India' such as construction, manufacturing industries, mining, etc. affect indigenous tribal people socially and ecologically. Any investment for manufacturing industries and construction heavily depends on acquisition of land and natural resources. Land is the very basic to tribal life and culture and due to alienation to it, it has become a major issue for their survival. Yet after independence, Indian State has been using the colonial law, the Land Acquisition Act, 1894, for acquiring land for industrial establishments under the doctrine of 'eminent domain' for greater good and development purposes, as result of which, millions of people have become displaced from their homes (Janhavi, 2013:44). In more than 70 years after independence, India ushered large scale development projects. According to an estimate, India has built about 4,000 large dams. They have submerged 2.5 million acres and deprived 50 million people, and provide irrigation facilities to just 10 per cent of the cropped land in the country (G. Venkataramana, 2012). The majority of disadvantaged and displaced persons for the cause of mega projects are the tribals. As per the survey of Action Aid and Indian Social Institute over 14 million people have been displaced from their homes in the four states of Andra Pradesh, Chhattisgarh, Orissa and Jharkhand. A total of 10.2 million acres have been acquired for setting up of development projects such as mines industrial plants and dams in these states in the last decade. Out of the 14 million displaced persons in these four states, 79 per cent were tribals (Janhavi, 2013: 46). Thus, for the mega projects and industrialisation, the Fifth Schedule is under attack (Samata, Mines, 2006: 499).

Conclusion and Suggestions

I conclude with some suggestions under the following five subheadings:

a) Literacy and awareness of e-citizenship among tribals

Bringing awareness and literacy on e-governance is urgent among tribal segments in India. It is essential in order to make them able to participate in e-governance. E-citizenship entails new form of rights to take part in the Information Society enabled by modern Information Communication Technology (Yu Chenung, 2009: 755). The members of tribal communities should be made able through e-education to access the growing body of information on the Internet, use cyberspace channel to communicate and express their opinions and engage in transactions with citizens, government and business operators.

b) Balance between digital economy and tribal subsistence economy

Digital communication is a vehicle of globalization and market economy. Globalization influences culture as well. It promotes mass culture or popular culture. Tribal people keep away distance from market economy ushered by globalization and follow subsistence economy in order to preserve their distinct cultural identity. But in the process, they suffer economic disadvantage and marginalization. The subsistence economy that the tribal people follow is in tune with their identity. The modern India project often tends to exploit natural resources for development without preserving for the future generation. Hence, there should be balance between market economy enhanced with Digital Information Communication Technology (DICT) and the subsistence economy of tribal people.

c) Safeguarding Scheduled Areas

While initiating economic programme like 'Make in India' care must be taken to protect the Schedule Areas. This programme involves large scale land acquisition and also it invites foreign investors for creating manufacturing hubs. In this process, Schedule Areas should not be targeted with the doctrine of eminent domain for greater good without benefiting the original settlers there. Schedule Areas must be protected from the onslaught of globalization and at the same time all benefits of 'Digital India', 'Make India' and other similar programmes must reach

the disadvantaged tribal people. The United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous People (2007) states: 'Indigenous peoples shall not be forcibly removed from their lands or territories. No relocation shall take place without the free, prior and informed consent of the indigenous peoples concerned and after agreement on just and fair compensation and, where possible, with the option of return'(Article 10). Further, it states: 'Indigenous peoples have the right to the lands, territories and resources which they have traditionally owned, occupied or otherwise used or acquired' (Article 26 (1). Indian State has enacted the Central law Panchayats (Extension to Scheduled Areas) Act, (PESA) 1996, which is a crucial legislation to empower tribal people to have control over their governance and resources through traditional rights. But the State governments have not implemented due to lack of State rule and hence tribals are yet to benefit from this Act (Ramanath, 2013).

d) Digital economy with cultural preservation

The digital economy accomplished by digital information communication technology must take care of the cultural dimension of tribal people. The Geneva World Summit on the Information Society, 2003, emphasises that 'in the evolution of the Information Society, particular attention must be given to the special situation of indigenous peoples, as well as to the preservation of their heritage and their cultural legacy (WSIS 2003: 15). Language is an essential part of cultural heritage. According to the Linguistic Survey of India, India speaks 780 languages, 220 lost in last 50 years (Lalmalsawma, 2013). Most of these endangered languages belong to the tribal groups. On the other hand, digital inclusion demands learning and using English language. Hence, as a measure of digital inclusion, digital information should be made available in tribal languages.

e) Social inclusion essential for digital inclusion

Since literacy, internet connectivity, electricity, computer usage is vital to digital inclusion, government must give priority to develop such infrastructure in Schedule Areas of tribal habitats. Since, digital inclusion of tribals demand social inclusion, the problems of inequalities, deprivation, corruptions and exploitation of tribals must be checked and stopped. The development projects and schemes targeted to

benefit indigenous people in Schedule Areas must be implemented sincerely. As per one estimate, in the implementation of the projects, only two per cent is spent actually on tribal welfare and development, whereas the remaining expenditure is budgeted for salaries of staff, vehicles, buildings, circuit house, tourist bungalow, office buildings and such other infrastructure which hardly benefit the tribals directly (Narwani, 2004: 21). If Information Communication Technology infrastructure is not made available in tribal areas and their capacities are not built in order to use digital information available through Internet based E-governance, tribal communities will be further marginalised and excluded from economic growth.

References

Altheide, D. L. (1985). *Media power*. New Delhi: Sage Publications

Census of India. (2011). Provisional Population Totals. New Delhi: Government of India

FAO. (2017) . '*ICT and SDGs: How Information and Communications Technology can Accelerate Action on the Sustainable Development Goals'*. United Nations

Helsper, E. (2008). *Digital inclusion: an analysis of social disadvantage and the information society*. Department for Communities and Local Government.

Jane Seale. (2009). *Digital Inclusion*. University of Southampton.

Janhavi, S. S. (2010). An Overview of Land Acquisition Act and Human Rights Issues. *Insight*, *60*, 177.

Janhavi, S. S. (2013). An Overview of Land Acquisition Act and Human Rights Issues, *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science Invention*, 2 (9). pp 44-49.

Kapoor, D. (2015, March 22). *E-Governance and Modi Government's Ambitious "Digital India"*. patheos.com.

Lakra N. (2010). *Tribal representation in mainstream media in India: a critical analysis*, Social Action, 60 (4).

Lalmalsawma, D. (2013). India speaks 780 languages, 220 lost in last 50 years–survey. Reuters.

Lucas, A. (1996). Indigenous people in cyberspace. *Leonardo*, 29(2), 101-108.

Narwani, G. S. (2004). *Tribal Law in India*, Jaipur: Rawat Publications.

Panda, M. I., Chhatar, M. D. C., & Mharana, B. (2013). A brief view to digital divide in Indian scenario. *International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications*, 3(12), 1-7.

Ramanath, R. (2013, February 5). *Tribals yet to benefit from PESA Act.*

Rao, G. V. (2013, February 12). *Damn the dams, says expert.* thehindu.com.

Samata and Mines. (2006). Globalisation in the Scheduled Areas. In Saksena, H. S., Srivastava, V. K., & Chaudhury, S. K. (ed.) *Scheduled Tribes and Development*. New Delhi: Serials Publications.

Sumanjeet (2006). e-governance: an overview in the Indian context. *The Indian Journal of Political Science*, 67 (4).

Thakur, S. (2012). Issue of Social Inclusion and Exclusion of Indian Tribes. International Journal on Arts, Management and Humanities, 1(1), 14-19.

Thomas, J. K. (2005). *Human Rights of Tribal*, Vol II, Delhi: Isha Books.

Wong, Yu Cheung and Fung, John Yat Chu and Law, Chi Kwong and Lam, Jolie Chi Yee and Lee, Vincent Wan Ping, Tackling the Digital Divide. (2009). *British Journal of Social Work*, 39, (4), pp. 754-767.

Modern Self-Making of Tribal Women in India: A Narrative from the Margins

Annapurna Pandey[1]

Abstract

This paper is about Rupali, a young tribal woman whose life history puts the tribal women's situation in a new perspective. It is about how indigeneity interacts with globalization. It is represented in a narrative form by bringing the voice of Rupali to the fore. Despite studies and media reports on how globalization has adversely affected the tribal population in India, the experience of women like Rupali to succeed in a highly competitive neo-liberal economy of contemporary India is remarkable and goes on to show the resilience and confidence of women like Rupali to make progress in the lives. This paper will analyze why in the era of globalization and modernization, women are left out from higher education in remote corners of the state and how women are breaking their social isolation and reaching out for horizontal camaraderie to access the opportunities available.

1. University of California, Santa Cruz, California 95064

Keywords: Tribal Women, Globalisation, Affirmative Action

Introduction

In the summer of 2013, I was spending a few days with my friends in Bhubaneswar, Odisha. Both husband and wife are academics and their only daughter was doing her doctoral studies at JNU, New Delhi where I did my graduate work. I encountered a new face, Rupali Mullick[1], a beautiful, shy but a very sharp young woman living with them. Her life story is a revealing case of modern self-making of tribal women made possible due to emerging opportunities through technology; higher education through the affirmative action policy of the state; and the active support of the urban elite. I would share the account of this tribal woman from *Kandhamal*, who is on her way to fulfilling her rare dream: to stand on her own after graduating from a prestigious college in Odisha. She dreams of being an academic and helping women in her community to become successful like her. I argue that Rupali is articulating herself as ambitious, cosmopolitan, and modern who competes with the fellow city women coming from higher classes and castes. This case study counters the stigma of a weak and marginalized Adivasi woman portrayed in the developmental discourse and echoed by the state and media. She is remaking herself, using the new tools provided both by globalization and state. The rise of the global economy, where social and economic development are driven by knowledge coupled with the information and technological revolution, signifies that the modern higher education must take into account new technologies and prepare younger generations to be part of the global skilled, flexible, and productive workforce (The World Bank Report, 2015).

Odisha is known for its distinct tribal population –out of 42 million people, 1 out of 4 belongs to one of its 62 scheduled Tribes (STs)[2].

---

[1]   Name has been anoni mised for the purpose of protecting the id entity.

[2]   They are also known as *Adivasis* (adi: "original"; *vasi "one who dwells")* refers to the original people who have lived in their land and claim to have been encroached by the Hindus. Their discourse on *Adivasis* is at par with the discourse on indigeneity which are developed in the supranational bodies like UN, World Bank and ILO, WTO, WHO among others, specially on the basis of race, ethnicity and language who have been marginalized in the hands of the mainstream. The Indian Constitution has however, named them as Scheduled Tribes (ST).

There are several studies on the educational status of tribal women which are hardly encouraging (Mishra, 2011, Pradhan, 2010, Devi and Mahesh, 2011, Barma, 2012). In Odisha, the highest number of students (74.47%) are enrolled in undergraduate studies followed by enrolment in diploma courses (12.42%) and post-graduate studies (9.96%). Male enrolment (52.94%) is higher than female enrolment (47.06%). Despite expansion policies, 15-20% of total intake capacity remains vacant across the different colleges. Explanations include low female, ST and SC[3] participation in general stream colleges and are more pronounced in specialized colleges such as engineering and medicine (The World Bank Report, 2015). In spite of 50% of seats reserved for SC and ST members, why is there low enrollment for women compared to men both in the scheduled category and general category? Some studies cite the cultural gap between tribal girls and the modern school environment leading to the drop out of tribal girls (Barma, 2012).[4] But that may not always be the case. This paper will analyze why in the process of globalization and modernization, women are left out from higher education in remote corners of the state and how women are breaking their social isolation and reaching out for horizontal camaraderie to access the opportunities available.

Women's movements have been the strength of India, especially against patriarchy - referring to violence against women including dowry deaths, rapes, abuse, desertion and displacement, and lately witchcraft[5], as reported in the popular literature and media. There is hardly any anthropological study on the impact of globalization, technology, and the state policies on affirmative action impacting the lives of tribal women. My hope in introducing the remaking of identity of a modern tribal woman is to seek out possibilities for the present moment of women's

---

[3] ST refers to Scheduled Tribe and SC refers to Scheduled castes as designated by the Indian constitution.

[4] This has been cited by Subrata Mishra, Development and Tribal Women of Odisha, The Tribal Tribune, Vol.5, issue 2.

[5] In Dec, 2013, the state of Odisha lunched the prevention of witch hunting bill, which states that anyone found guilty of engaging in witch hunts shall be punished with imprisonment up to three years with a fine, which could extend up to seven years, cited by Anusa Mukherjee, The prevalence of witches, Telegraph, Feb 4, 2014. http://epaper.telegraphindia.com/details/61044-18956906.html

education especially in the rural and tribal areas of the state. As an anthropologist, I refrain from representing her, rather, I let her tell her story.

My Encounter with Rupali

In December 2012 during my visit to Odisha, Minati[6] and her husband went out of the state to attend an academic conference and Rupali and I were staying together in my friend's home. Our daily chore was to cook one meal in the morning to sustain us for the whole day and in the process we opened up to each other. Jointly cooking our morning rice, dal and a vegetable, reminded me of my hostel days in college and I felt like a 19-year-old all over again. One morning, Rupali ran into my room with the local newspaper, *Mausi*, mo *gaun na paper re baharichi* (Aunt, my village is in the news today, referring to Samaj, Dec 24 2012). I checked- The Samaj Relief funds had gone to Daringbadi and Gazalbadi in Kandhamal region to distribute blankets in the cold winter. In December, even though the weather is pretty mild in Bhubaneswar, in Kandhamal, it is already one to three degrees Celsius. Rupali is from Gazalbadi, a village 20km from Daringbadi in the Kandhamal region of Southern Odisha. This area is the most picturesque in the state with its plentiful natural resources including all kinds of vegetables, fruits, bamboo, and coffee. It is also popularly called the Kashmir of Odisha where there is snowfall in the winter and it is surrounded by beautiful tall hills and natural springs. It is about 900 meters above sea level and from colonial times, has been used as a summer resort by British officials. The name Kandhamal refers to the Kandhas who inhabit this area. With a population of over a million, Kandhas is the largest tribal group in the state of Odisha (Padel, 2011). They are largely concentrated in Kandhamal, Koraput, Rayagada, Nabarangpur, Kalahandi and Gajapati districts. When I visited Kandhamal in 1986 –1987, I was struck by the natural beauty of the area and was amazed to see the vibrant lifestyle of the Kuttia Kandhas and nearby Dongaria Kandhas, living in the area. Both men and women would work together in the field on hill slopes and would have evening dance ceremonies in their small hamlets. Kandhamal is

---

[6]   Names have been anonomised.

unique in terms of its sex ratio with 1,037 females for every 1,000 males compared to the state sex ratio of 934 to 1000 (2011 census).

Life in Kandhamal and Social Change

Men and women in Kandhamal, like the rest of the tribals, are traditionally equal partners in producing and collecting food from the jungle, but their relationship has been disrupted by the multiple levels of oppression they experience due to the multi-national corporate mining venture, urbanization, and industrialization of this region. The Kandhas like other tribes see a correlation between a rise in alcohol consumption by men and their violence toward women; between women's lack of access to the forest resources and their poverty; between gender and sexual exploitation; and between culture loss and identity crisis. The tribal women's problems are varied: poverty, health and nutrition, economy, development, education, biodiversity, training and empowerment, violence against women, media attention, and participation in decision making (Mishra, Aug. 20, 2001). I can see, in the development model borrowed from the West, a clear discrepancy between the state's ideology and the existing cultural, social, and economic realities of tribal women in Odisha and elsewhere in India. As Kim Berry observes, "Ideas about women and their needs are created out of and are nested within unequal power relations" (Berry, p.78, 2003). In spite of 50% of the seats reserved for ST and SC members in higher education institutions, in 2015, only 4.6% ST women completed 2 years of college and only 4.3% graduated.

The exploitation of the Kandhas is nothing new. It has gone on for a very long time as FG Bailey and other scholars have reported. During the British colonial period, their land was classified and became available for profit-making leading to their land alienation. The role of missionaries, moneylenders, zamindars, and the British punitive rules and regulations were major sources of their exploitation (F. G. Bailey, 1957, 1960, 1969). After independence, the exploitation of tribal women at the hands of the outsiders, especially businessmen, government officials, and developers has been studied (Pandey, 2008). What is new is robbing them of their land and their livelihood by state-supported and sponsored multi-national mining projects.

Kandhamal region has recently been in the news. The state of Odisha, especially the southern belt comprising of Koraput, Balangir and Kalahandi districts (KBK), is endowed with 1,733 million tons (70%) of the total Bauxite resources of the country. In the post-liberalization period, this mineral resource has attracted many multi-national corporations both from within and outside the country, dragging this state into the globalization arena. The state wholeheartedly supports these initiatives, attracting huge revenue from the mining. During 1992-1997, bauxite resources in Odisha pulled in $20.5 billion dollars. Vedanta Aluminum Ltd has set up and is operating a one million ton alumina refinery at Lanjigarh, in the district of Kalahandi, based on a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) signed with the Government of Odisha which stipulates that up to 150 million tons of bauxite for the plant will be supplied from nearby Niyamagiri hills (Vedanta report, 2012). However, with the protest of the local Dongaria Kandhas, the Union ministry of Environment and Forest (MoEF) has disallowed bauxite excavation at Niyamgiri. Ironically, even though this area has the vast natural resources, these mining projects have had adverse impacts on the local tribal people, leading to their physical displacement, loss of land, and access to the forest and its resources - all of which affects their livelihoods. The state is getting plenty of revenue and has fervently promoted mining as a sure way to curb unemployment among the youth in Odisha. The middle class ambitious youth and entrepreneurs from different parts of the state have flocked to these areas and have found a quick way of making money. But the mining project areas are inhabited by tribal people – they live and breathe around these mines and have remained poor. It is not a surprise that this area is known for the extensive upsurge of Maoists, the rebels who are fighting against the state and society for unequal distribution of wealth between the haves and have-nots.

The Niyamagiri hills provide major livelihood sources to the Dongaria Kondhs – not only as their source of food and water, but also for their identity and spirituality. As per their origin myth, Donger *raja* is their god, ancestor, and the source of their being. They realize, with bauxite mining in the area, their kin and clan are displaced and have suffered severe blows – depletion of forest resources has become the biggest threat in the wake of mining projects in the surrounding districts. This has been accompanied by major health hazards caused by the "piling

up of solid effluents such as red mud and tons of sodium hydroxide, leaving a high PH level in the soil and loss of vegetation and natural habitats" (Padhi and Panigrahi, 2011,p. 43).

It is interesting to note that the state government advertises the establishment of Bauxite mining by NALCO at Damanjodi only 110 kilometers from Kashipur as the symbol of the state pride. In reality, it has adversely affected the tribal people and their livelihoods. With the depletion of forest resources, people are displaced in their own land and are forced to perform wage labor. Around every bauxite mine, local people testify that their water sources that were perennial have dried up and this is just part of the danger faced by farmers in the area. I observed similar situations while visiting the Aditya Birla mining project in the neighboring city of Barbil in Keonjhar district. There are eighty iron ore mines operating in this region around Barbil, as it is known as the fifth largest deposit of iron ore and manganese ore in the world. I was shocked to see the thick red dust all over the trees, roads, and houses. While visiting the mining sites, I could see the open cast-mining mile after mile, the hills which had been cut down, and piles of iron ore which were mounted and transported by trucks to the nearby railway station. The people have moved away from the hills and are living in small makeshift housing and were standing in line to work in the mines. The non-tribal *babus* (white collar workers) hold all the managerial jobs while the low paying manual jobs are given to the tribals. Clearly, one can see that there was no fair sharing of the profit made by the mines. Even though the multinational mining corporations are making excessive profit, illegal mining is common and has created scores of millionaires coming from the plains; the tribals remain poor and are mostly illiterate.[7]

It is because of the dedication and the courage shown by the Dongria Kondhs that Niyamgiri hills are still untouched (apart from the refinery below). For the people, Niyamgiri hills are too precious to be touched.

---

[7] The district has a high percentage of tribal population, which is 44.5 per cent of the total population. The literacy rate among the tribal people of the district tunes to 40.3 per cent out of which ST male literacy is 38.01 per cent and ST female literacy rate is 25.97 per cent. Laxman Kumar Sahoo, "Socio-Economic Profile of Tribal Populations in Mayurbhanj and Keonjhar Districts", Odisha Review, May 2011, pp. 63-68, http://Odisha.gov.in/magazine/Odishareview/2011/may/engpdf/63-68.pdf

We all know that once the machines move in, it is a slippery slope and those hills will become history. The Dongaria Kondhs in Niyamgiri hills have raised their voice against such mega-development projects. They have questioned these development projects by asking "Development for whom and at whose cost?" noting that it steals tribal people of their non- renewable livelihood resources. This is one of the reasons why there have been several protests of the tribal people in Odisha against the state sponsored bauxite mining operations in 1985, 1996, 1997, 2000, and 2005 (Padhy and Panigrahy, 2011). This shows the conflict between the state sponsored development, which favors industrialization and mining, and that of the people who prefer sustainable livelihood provided by their environment. In all these movements women have taken an active part through picketing, processions, and public hearings. The emergence of an indigenous leadership made all these movements more widespread.

Rupali: A Personal Narrative

Since I have given a description of the Kandhamal, where Rupali is from, and the mining which has created vast changes in this area, let me return to her life history narrative. Rupali's father Kirt Mullick (she says his anglicized name must have been influenced by the Christian missionary presence in the village) worked as a daily laborer and is presently the supervisor at the bamboo factory in the village, with its head office in Rayagada. Her mother Muktilata Mullick has been primarily taking care of seven children (three brothers and four sisters, Rupali the second to last sister). Her family has no land and the entire family works as daily laborers. She brought in a copy of her father's income certificate and it states: no agricultural land, no salary, Daily labor (doing wage work) Rs.12, 000 (approximately 200 dollars) per year, qualifying him as below Poverty Line (BPL).

According to Rupali's caste/tribe certificate[8], she belongs to the Kandha tribe. They have been included in the SC/ST category, created for affirmative action benefits, known as protective discrimination in the

---

[8] and are included in the It is recognized as scheduled caste(SC)/scheduled tribe(ST) under the constitution (SCs) order, 1950 and (STS) order, and amended by the SC and ST Amendment orders/Act 1976. The caste certificate is issued at the office of the Tahasildar, Surada, collected on 18/5/11.

constitution of India[9]. Because of their excessive exploitation by the plains people who have invaded their region as moneylenders, contractors, state and central government employees, the Kandhas have been designated as the "particularly vulnerable tribal groups (PTGs)"[10] From Rupali's narrative, it appears that her father was influenced by Christianity in his area and came to the realization that education is the means to improve one's social condition in post-independent India. He was able to have all seven of his children educated up to class ten. None of them had completed high school except Rupali. She tells me that her older sister has been elected as the Sarapanch in her in-law's village (Sidhhapur, Odisha). One of her brothers went to Andhra, the neighboring state as a migrant *dadan* laborer[11] and acquired a supervisor's position because of his high school education.

Rupali on her way to the urban and modern world

In the Summer of 2011, Rupali Mullick graduated from Ma Kandhauni Devi high school in her village (yet to be government approved and accredited) securing 33% (barely passing marks). She became the first Kui girl in her village to have passed high school. I could see how proud she is of her degree when she brought in her high school certificate to show me her singular achievement. In order to apply for her college admission on the internet, her older brother travelled to a nearby town (22 km from Gajalbadi) and targeted six colleges. Thanks to the affirmative

---

[9, 10] Keeping in view the independent life style, culture and lack of acculturation of some of the tribal groups, they have been treated as a separate group and were termed as Primitive Tribal Group in the 5th plan (1974-78) period. In order to avoid the word "primitive" they have been redesignated as Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Groups (PTGs). Odisha houses 13 Primitive Tribal Groups out of total 75 Primitive Tribal Groups in India, the highest in number. For reference, http://Odisha.gov.in/e-magazine/Odishareview/2010/December/engpdf/203-206.pdf

[11] The system of employment of Inter-State migrant labor known as Dadan Labor is in vogue in many states in India. Middlemen known as Sardars or Khatadars recruit Dadan Labor from various parts of the State for work outside the State in large construction projects.. These laborers are controlled by their employers and do not have much of a voice without any support network. Keeping in view of numerous cases of their exploitation, the Inter-State. Migrant Workmen (Regulation of Employment and Conditions of Service) Bill, 1979 was introduced in the Parliament. Refer, http://www.delhi.gov.in/wps/wcm/connect/doit_labour/Labour/Home/Acts+Implemented/Details+of+the+Acts+Implemented/The+Inter-State+Migrant+Workmen+Act/

action, as a tribal girl barely passing from high school, she was admitted to Ramadevi college in the capital city of Bhubaneswar, named after the freedom fighter and a great feminist activist from Odisha. But she was put on the waiting list for her residential accommodation at the college's Indira Gandhi residential hostel, the only one for tribal girls. Once she got her acceptance letter, she thought that she would automatically get a hostel space.

"My father and I along with my brother-in- law, arrived at the college in the morning with all my belongings and I took admission but was told that there was no hostel seat for me. I was devastated. I ran to the assistant superintendent of the hostel and was told that I was the last on the list and all the seats have been filed up. I knew that if I do not get hostel seat now, I will lose one year and that would be the end of my education. I begged her that even without a bed I will sleep on the floor. My father was crying too. Then she sent me to Minati madam, the superintendent of the tribal hostel at the college. It was already late afternoon and I asked who she is and where I will find her. I was told that she was in the classroom. I waited outside her class. As soon as she got out of the classroom, I ran to her and begged " Madam, I did not get hostel seat". Madam said, " go back to your village and come next year". I could not hold my tears. Madam asked me to wait till the end of the day. My father, brother in law and I had not eaten a morsel. Around 5PM, Madam came to the faculty common room. She looked at me and said, would you stay in my house?"
(personal conversation with Rupali).

Rupali could not believe her ears and she said that she would do everything to continue her higher education. The professor decided to keep her at her home in order to continue her studies at Rama Devi College. The next hurdle was to convince the professor's husband. He is a simple man but with a set mind of his own. He along with his whole family are the disciples of Thakur Anukulchandra, a late 19th century holy man and is a staunch vegetarian who does not eat onion and garlic. Knowing his nature, habits, and spiritual orientation, he was reluctant to have somebody unknown living in the house. But Rupali was determined and Minati persuaded her husband. When he heard

the name Rupali (which also happens to be the wife of the most wanted Naxalite leader, from her village area ridden with the Maoist movement), he was all the more reluctant but still Minati brought her home.

Rupali says, "My father was in doubt. He called my mother and she said, "what is Rupali saying?" I said, " I am getting this opportunity. If something happens, I will call you and ask you to take me back. I really did not want to go back to the village and I was ready to make it here. I realized that this is my only window to achieve something better and it was my decision to make my future" (personal conversation).

A Life Changing Experience

Rupali successfully went to school unlike so many of her cohorts coming from the rural and tribal areas. Sadly, because of sheer lack of information, many of them do not know the possibilities available for their higher education. Even if they are admitted to college, they assume that college admission guarantees room and board as well. Brokers who promise them room and board but run away after getting their commission also misguide them. Some of the students coming from *Ashram* (residential high schools, which include room and board as well) assume that college would provide them with the same facilities. Now with internet admissions, uneducated parents and guardians are left in the dark about the provisions and facilities their children are going to have in college. My friend says that parents bring their children with all their belongings to get them settled and are extremely frustrated when they learn that higher education for their daughters does not mean just a guaranteed spot in the college. These ethnographic case studies help us realize how the subaltern citizens experience the lack of cultural capital in spite of affirmative action, creating a gulf between them and the rest of the society. It must be heart-breaking for both the parents and more so for their daughters to be unable to avail the benefits of affirmative action at the social, personal, and bureaucratic levels.

Many of her friends had warned Minati about the pitfalls of a tribal girl living in an educated household because they assumed that she would

be totally unfamiliar with the sanitation and hygiene of a Hindu middle-class household. But she discovered that Rupali was a fast learner and within no time she acquired the skills of urban living. Rupali dresses up like any other city girl – showing off her slim legs in her skinny jeans and tight t-shirts. She keeps a key to the house and has learnt to take buses to go to college, about three kilometers from her professor's house. On the road, when she encounters young men on the street trying to befriend her or tease her, she keeps a straight face and does not even acknowledge them. She uses a mobile phone but does not entertain any calls that she is not very sure of or is not familiar with. In order to avoid any curiosity or hear any lewd comments from the street boys, she keeps her cell phone hidden and does not even make a call or receive one on the street. She makes sure not to befriend anybody on the street or invite anybody to her host's home. It must have been quite a restraint for a girl growing up in a face-to-face community in tribal Odisha. She keeps her friends circle to a minimum and never invites her college friends to her home. Being alone at home, she does not open the door to any stranger. She shared an interesting incident – once one of the disciples of *Guru Anukulchandra* knocked on the door and introduced himself as the *Guru* brother of her professor's husband, following the same spiritual order. He requested her to let him in but she was adamant and asked him to come back when he was around.

Living in a vegetarian household, Rupali has become a strict vegetarian, a huge sacrifice since she was used to a different diet. She helps her Professor in preparing morning breakfast and lunch and keeps herself confined to her room preparing for her studies. Minati tells me that she had to study her elementary English starting from 3rd grade and now Rupali has passed her 12th grade exam securing 41%, far better compared to her high school result. Additionally, she has finished a computer literacy course and a spoken English course. Simultaneously, she is doing a correspondence degree course on Tourism management from Indira Gandhi National University, Delhi. It holds bright prospects for her and will heighten her chances of landing her a job in the city.

Rupali looked radiant and full of enthusiasm when I saw her last year in Bhubaneswar. During my talk at her college, she asked me a question in

English about my message to the young women in Odisha. I was so impressed! Minati told me that Rupali wrote a letter to the editor in the local newspaper regarding the sex scandals of Morari Bapu and Ashram Babpu, the religious Holy men in the news, criticizing the role of Gurus/holy men who are exploiting people and extracting money from them, sexually abusing young men and women and hoodwinking the community of believers in the name of religiosity. She has accused these men of exploiting people for their blind faith. In college, Rupali has joined a dance group and she proudly tells me that her group of five dancers (one out of 65 groups), has been selected as one among six selected to perform at the college annual function. These six groups were selected after a rigorous three round of auditions, a rare achievement indeed. I was amazed – a tribal girl who would have remained in the dark in her village, now has taken advantage of the state affirmative action, globalization and goodwill of an educationist to get out of poverty and is thinking on her feet and is already showing the signs of a person of her own.

Her Professor tells me that Rupali made her a request to help her younger brother who was studying in class eight in their village school. Now he has come to live with the Professor's younger sister in the city to pursue his high school degree. Since he has come for his high school studies, he would not have to struggle unlike Rupali to keep up with the standards of the college and would do better in his higher education. A little girl from the remote Kandhamal, known as the most primitive tribe, is spreading her wings in the city and has the courage to touch the sky. Rupali is not bothered by the neighbors whispering to each other - "I got the opportunity to study and I am so happy!"

Conclusion

I have been studying the Kandha community in Kandhaamal since 1980s when I was in graduate studies at Jawaharlal Nehru University (JNU). My earlier focus was their exploitation at the hands of the plains people as I have discussed elsewhere (Pandey, 2007). More recently I have discussed tribal resistance movement against Mining in the Kandhmal Region of Odisha, India as part of a collection of resistance movements in Mountain regions (Pandey, 2013). During the last two years, thanks

to my Professor friend, I happened to meet Rupali whose life history puts the tribal women's situation in a new perspective. Globalization, the affirmative action policy of the state and the changing attitude of the elite towards its marginalized communities, have made it possible for someone like Rupali to succeed in a highly competitive neo-liberal economy of contemporary India.

References

Barma, P. (2012). "Educational Empowerment of the Tribal women of Odisha: A Study of the PTGS of the Nuapada District of the KBK", *Odisha Review*.

Berry, K. (2003). *Developing women: the traffic in ideas about women and their needs in Kangra, India.* Regional modernities: The cultural politics of development in India, 75-98.

Devi, S., & Mahesh, E. (2011). Development of education of scheduled tribes in Orissa: The role of PESA Act. *Centre for Multidisciplinary Development Research*, Alur Venkatrao Circle, Karnataka, India, P-15.

Elvin, V. (1937), *Phulmat of the Hills: A Tale of the Gonds.* London: J. Murray.

Kingsolver, A. E., & Gunewardena, N. (Eds.). (2007). *The Gender of Globalization: Women Navigating Cultural and Economic Marginalilies*. School for Advanced Research Press.

Mishra, B. (2011). *Higher Education of SC/ST Girls in Orissa: A Study of Participation and Attainment*. Gyan Publishing House.

Pradhan, A. (2011). "Odisha Right to education act 2010: A Critique" (In Odia, Odisha Sikshya Adhikar Niyam,2010-Eka samikshya). *Samadrusti*. 6 (1).

Padel, F., & Das, S. (2010). *Out of this earth: East India Adivasis and the aluminium cartel.* New Delhi: Orient Blackswan.

Pandey, A. (2007) Globalization, Swadeshi, and Women's Movements in Orissa, India. In Nandini Gunewardena and Ann Kingsolver (eds.) *The Gender of Globalization*. Santa Fe: School for Advanced Research Press, pp. 257- 276.

Shah, A. (2010). *In the Shadows of the State: Indigenous Politics, Environmentalism, and Insurgency in Jharkhand, India*. Duke University Press.

World Bank Publications. (2015) *The World Bank annual report 2015*. World Bank Publications

Challenges of Community Radio and Tribal Development in India

R. Sreedher[1]

Abstract

India's community radio (CR) policy originally proposed in 2002, and later modified in 2006 gives large scope for tribal development. Among the 187 operational community radio stations, there are hardly less than 10 community radio stations which are doing some programmes for tribal development in this country. There are functional CR stations in Odisha, Maharashtra, Chhattisgarh, Madhya Pradesh Assam, which are situated in or adjoining tribal areas. The author with his experience of establishing and working for sustainability of CR station will be looking into the challenges and prospects of community radio in tribal areas, which have been discussed in the paper. The presentation also will trace case studies and discuss sustainability of such models in tribal development. The example of Vaniya establishing a series of CR stations in Madhya Pradesh and their effect on the targeted audience will be discussed in detail. The significance of community radio in reducing inequality of tribals vis a vis the dominant population is emphasized which is also one of the goals of the SDGs 2030.

1. Consultant Commonwealth Educational Media Centre for Asia and Prof Emeritus Apeejay Stya University, India

Introduction

In the Five Year Plans, the programmes for the welfare of the scheduled tribes aim at: 1. Raising the productivity levels in agriculture, animal husbandry, forestry, cottage and small-scale industries etc., to improve the economic conditions. 2. Rehabilitation of the bonded labour. 3. Education and training programmes. 4. Special development programmes for women and children. But the government has no specific programme for communicating with the tribals and also give voice to the voiceless through an electronic medium. Community radio can very well fit into the situation. But so far the efforts in Kerala, Odisha and Madhya Pradesh are pilots in nature and there is no mechanism to extend these models.

Many of the estimated 80 million members of India's tribal communities lack access to any mainstream media outlets. This often poses serious barriers to their socio-economic development, as their grievances about government neglect and economic exploitation remain unvoiced. In addition, certain factions (such as the Maoist insurgency) can exploit their frustration and isolation to violent ends. To address this important problem, *CGNetSwara*: a voice portal that enables ordinary citizens to report and discuss issues of local interest was launched in Chattisgarh. In order to use it, they dial a phone number using any mobile (or fixed line) phone. Callers are prompted to press "1" to record a new message, and "2" to listen to messages that have already been recorded. Once a message has been recorded from the field, professional, trained journalists, who access the system using a Web-based interface, review and verify the report. Approved reports are then made available for playback over the phone. The reports also can be accessed on the *CGnetSwara* website.

Radio Mattoli has been broadcasting tribal development programmemes both in tribal languages and Malayalam since the radio station was launched on 1st of June 2009.

Radio is one of the main sources of information and entertainment for the majority of Tribal people in Wayanad. Due to lack of electricity and other related amenities, the most accessible and affordable means

of communication technology available at present is nothing other than radio. In January 2014, in association with Tribal development department of Kerala Radio Mattoli begins production and broadcasting of programmemesfor the development of tribes in Wayanad district. The series titled "Unarvu" (awakening) aims at various elements including livelihood, health and education etc., apart from fostering socio-cultural-economical aspects of tribes. Having spent half a decade in community broadcasting now the team of community Radio clearly understands multiple problems prevailing among the tribes and knows how to tackle the issues utilizing the potential of the Information Communication Technology tool, Radio Mattoli 90.4.

The broadcast of "Unarvu" series is started on 15th of January for a period of one year.Tribal folks immensely benefit from Radio Mattoli awareness programmes on health, education, promotion of tribal culture, employment generation etc. It has been expressed by many Gram Panchayath members that after the introduction of short modules through CRS on the necessity of Gram Sabhas and the participation of Tribal folk inOorukoottam. There is a remarkable increase in their active participation, in certain areas of Wayanad district, where the Tribal communities are regular listeners of Radio Mattoli.

The main focus of the 15 minutes documentary series in Unarvu, were as follows:The social evil of alcoholism and substance abuse. Unarvu series strive to address iteffectively.   Second focus is the revival of tribal culture and languages. Thirdly, theprogrammemes strive to improve the health and nutrition among the tribal families.As the fourth objective the programmemes air information on tribal welfare schemes on a real time basis. Lastly the programmemes focus on sensitization programmemes that showcase various development schemes of the government.

While formulating the programmemes and the contents of the programmeme, Mattoli has adopted participatory approach in content preparation by including our listeners too. With this

approach Tribal youth became active participants in the radio programmes, starting from the planning of the programmes till its broadcasting.

Radio Mattoli has been broadcasting tribal development programmemes both in tribal languages and Malayalam since the radio station was launched on 1st of June 2009.

Radio is one of the main sources of information and entertainment for the majority of Tribal people in Wayanad. Due to lack of electricity and other related amenities, the most accessible and affordable means of communication technology available at present is nothing other than radio. In January 2014, in association with Tribal development department of Kerala Radio Mattoli begins production and broadcasting of programmemes for the development of tribes in Wayanad district. The series titled "Unarvu" (awakening) aims at various elements including livelihood, health and education etc., apart from fostering socio-cultural-economical aspects of tribes. Having spent half a decade in community broadcasting now the team of community Radio clearly understands multiple problems prevailing among the tribes and knows how to tackle the issues utilizing the potential of the Information Communication Technology tool, Radio Mattoli 90.4.

The broadcast of "Unarvu" series is started on 15th of January for a period of one year. Tribal folks immensely benefit from Radio Mattoli awareness programmes on health, education, promotion of tribal culture, employment generation etc. It has been expressed by many Gram Panchayath members that after the introduction of short modules through CRS on the necessity of Gram Sabhas and the participation of Tribal folk inOorukoottam. There is a remarkable increase in their active participation, in certain areas of Wayanad district, where the Tribal communities are regular listeners of Radio Mattoli.

The main focus of the 15 minutes documentary series in Unarvu, were as follows: The social evil of alcoholism and substance abuse. Unarvu

series strive to address iteffectively. Second focus is the revival of tribal culture and languages. Thirdly, theprogrammemes strive to improve the health and nutrition among the tribal families.As the fourth objective the programmemes air information on tribal welfare schemes on a real time basis. Lastly the programmemes focus on sensitization programmemes that showcase various development schemes of the government.

While formulating the programmemes and the contents of the programmeme, Mattoli has adopted participatory approach in content preparation by including our listeners too. With this approach Tribal youth became active participants in the radio programmes, starting from the planning of the programmes till its broadcasting.

One of the important target groups of Radio Mattoli is the Adivasis (indigenous people) in Wayanad. We started radio broadcasting on 1st June, 2009 and from Day One onwards, programmes in tribal dialects were aired. This was a conscious act, to ensure more visibility to the life related problems of Adivasis, in their own language and culturalflavour. The programmes on different subjects in variety of forms were visualized, planned and carried out by selected and trained tribal young people, under the guidance of experts in the respective fields.

One of the important target groups of Radio Mattoli is the Adivasis (indigenous people) in Wayanad. We started radio broadcasting on 1st June, 2009 and from Day One onwards, programmes in tribal dialects were aired. This was a conscious act, to ensure more visibility to the life related problems of Adivasis, in their own language and culturalflavour. The programmes on different subjects in variety of forms were visualized, planned and carried out by selected and trained tribal young people, under the guidance of experts in the respective fields.

One of the important target groups of Radio Mattoli is the Adivasis (indigenous people) in Wayanad. We started radio broadcasting on 1st June, 2009 and from Day One onwards, programmes in tribal

dialects were aired. This was a conscious act, to ensure more visibility to the life related problems of Adivasis, in their own language and culturalflavour. The programmes on different subjects in variety of forms were visualized, planned and carried out by selected and trained tribal young people, under the guidance of experts in the respective fields.

Radio Mattoli has been broadcasting tribal development programmemes both in tribal languages and Malayalam since the radio station was launched on 1st of June 2009. Radio is one of the main sources of information and entertainment for the majority of Tribal people in Wayanad. Due to lack of electricity and other related amenities, the most accessible and affordable means of communication technology available at present is nothing other than radio. In January 2014, in association with Tribal development department of Kerala Radio Mattoli begins production and broadcasting of programmemes for the development of tribes in Wayanad district. The series titled "Unarvu" (awakening) aims at various elements including livelihood, health and education etc., apart from fostering socio-cultural-economical aspects of tribes. Having spent half a decade in community broadcasting now the team of community Radio clearly understands multiple problems prevailing among the tribes and knows how to tackle the issues utilizing the potential of the Information Communication Technology tool, Radio Mattoli 90.4.

The broadcast of "Unarvu" series is started on 15th of January for a period of one year. Tribal folks immensely benefit from Radio Mattoli awareness programmes on health,

education, promotion of tribal culture, employment generation etc. It has been expressed by many Gram Panchayath members that after the introduction of short modules through CRS on the necessity of Gram Sabhas and the participation of Tribal folk inOorukoottam. There is a remarkable increase in their active participation, in certain areas of Wayanad district, where the Tribal communities are regular listeners of Radio Mattoli.

The main focus of the 15 minutes documentary series in Unarvu, were as follows: The social evil of alcoholism and substance abuse. Unarvu series strive to address it effectively. Second focus is the revival of tribal culture and languages. Thirdly, the programmemes strive to improve the health and nutrition among the tribal families. As the fourth objective the programmemes air information on tribal welfare schemes on a real time basis. Lastly the programmemes focus on sensitization programmemes that showcase various development schemes of the government. While formulating the programmemes and the contents of the programmeme, Mattoli has adopted participatory approach in content preparation by including our listeners too.

With this approach Tribal youth became active participants in the radio programmes, starting from the planning of the programmes till its broadcasting.

The broadcast of "Unarvu" series is started on 15th of January for a period of one year. Tribal folks immensely benefit from Radio Mattoli awareness programmes on health, education, promotion of tribal culture, employment generation etc. It has been expressed by many Gram Panchayath members that after the introduction of short modules through CRS on the nec

Anil Lodha in his book says: "Development is the development of man, as an individual and as a social being, aiming at his liberation and at his fulfillment. Even after five decades of planned development, due to the inaccessibility of the tribal areas, hilly and tough topography as well as extreme variations in the climate conditions, the tribals have not been able to share the gains of development equally with the non – tribals and as a result, they have remained backward and poor."

His book describes the role of Mass Media in tribal development the mass communication channels such as traditional media, newspapers, radio and television have been used for information, education and entertainment. These channels have been found immensely in informing and educating the tribal people with low literacy levels. It highlights the

opinion of tribal people towards radio listening, television and film viewing and also towards the importance the traditional media. The study deals with the factors related to educational, social and economic status".

V. Subramanyam and K.R. Rama Mohan (Andhra University) observed:

"It is clear that 56.47% of the respondents are exposed to radio media. In general a lot of tribal people do not listen to the radio even during their leisure time. Only the head of the household and a few other members of a particular family listen to some of the radio programmes. Most of the radio listeners give more importance to the programmes like songs and dramas which are broadcasted at a particular time. Only a few of them listen the current news events and agricultural, health and education programmes. In the field villages, even a considerable number of illiterates are also access to film and radio media" (Subramanyam and Rama Mohan, Andhra University).

1.Radio Dhadkan , Madhya Pradesh

"Whenever they see me, people say, 'Here comes the Dhadkan Radio woman…," grins Ramvati, a tribal woman from the Sahariya tribe of Madhya Pradesh. Her usual day starts with a walk to five villages under her purview, where she interviews people and gathers information for her very own radio programmeme on the local radio station, Radio Dhadkan Shivpuri. While most women in these villages are mostly seen in a veil, Ramvati has created a unique identity for herself by using community radio as a tool for change and empowerment. Watch her beautiful journey as a radio jockey and how she has brought a change in these villages, and in her own life, through her work. Like she says, ***"Without information, change is not possible."***

2. Radio Mattoli – Waynad, Kerala

Radio Mattoli has been broadcasting tribal development programmes both in tribal languages and Malayalam since the radio station was launched on 1st of June 2009.Radio is one of the main sources of information and entertainment for the majority of Tribal people in

Wayanad. Due to lack of electricity and other related amenities, the most accessible and affordable means of communication technology available at present is nothing other than radio. In January 2014, in association with Tribal development department of Kerala Radio Mattoli begins production and broadcasting of programmes for the development of tribes in Wayanad district. The series titled "

Unarvu (awakening) aims at various elements including livelihood, health and education etc., apart from fostering socio-cultural-economical aspects of tribes. Having spent half a decade in community broadcasting now the team of community Radio clearly understands multiple problems prevailing among the tribes and knows how to tackle the issues utilizing the potential of the Information Communication Technology tool, Radio Mattoli 90.4. Tribal folks immensely benefit from Radio Mattoli awareness programmes on health, education, promotion of tribal culture, employment generation etc. It has been expressed by many Gram Panchayat members that after the introduction of short modules through CRS on the necessity of Gram Sabhas and the participation of Tribal folk in Oorukoottam. There is a remarkable increase in their active participation, in certain areas of Wayanad district, where the Tribal communities are regular listeners of Radio Mattoli. The main focus of the 15 minutes documentary series in Unarvu, were as follows: The social evil of alcoholism and substance abuse. Unarvu series strive to address it effectively. Second focus is the revival of tribal culture and languages. Thirdly, the programmes strive to improve the health and nutrition among the tribal families. As the fourth objective the programmes air information on tribal welfare schemes on a real time basis. Lastly the programmes focus on sensitization programmes that showcase various development schemes of the government. While formulating the programmes and the contents of the programme, Mattoli has adopted participatory approach in content preparation by including our listeners too. With this approach Tribal youth became active participants in the radio programmes, starting from the planning of the programmes till its broadcasting. A special team was in place for the coordination of the activities of the programme. The team first framed the broad objectives of each programme and they got them vetted by the experts. Based on the broad objectives the team prepared the

short audio documentaries on variety of topics, ranging from information sharing, preservation of culture, tribal development, education etc.

The programmes on different subjects in variety of forms were visualized, planned and carried out by selected and trained tribal young people, under the guidance of experts in the respective fields. Realizing the effectiveness and impact of these programmes, they approached the ST Development Department, through TDO Mananthavady requesting partial financial support for its continuity and it was granted by the District Working Group. The Adivasis received the programme with unprecedented enthusiasm. Their listening tools were radio sets and mobile handsets. Non availability of sufficient number of radio sets in tribal settlements paused a problem for accessing the programme and we requested the Government to provide one radio sets each to all the tribal settlements in Mananthavady Taluk in the 1st phase of the programme and that too was approved. After completing the first phase of the programme the Advisory Committee decided to do an impact assessment study of the completed phase, before submitting the proposal for the second one. As a result of that decision this study was undertaken, using scientific methods. The findings are highly rewarding and encouraging. There is every justification for continuing Unarvu programme through radio Mattoli.

Executive Summary of the findings of this study

1.Unarvu radio documentary programme is extensively listened by tribes especially the women. They find it as a handy tool to gather beneficial information and entertainment.2.Both youngsters and elders are interested in radio programmes as they satisfy the needs of the different age groups.3.Literates and illiterates listen to the community radio programme. Since the radio programmes under the Unarvu series are focusing more on general topics, they find it as a resourceful programmeme.4.The traditional patterns of tribal hamlets are undergoing changes and segregated family units are gaining importance. In this situation the radio communication is considered as equivalent to the communications of the head of the tribal hamlets in yester years.5.The reason for preference of the people on Radio Mattoli over other media such as news- paper and television is that the radio programmes is the

only means where they can receive and listen to information in their own dialects.6.Radio handset was found to be the most sought after choice to hear the Unarvu series. Further it was also pinpointed that there is lack of availability of radio handsets in the hamlets/families, thereby hampering the listenership of the tribal families

3.Radio Dhimsa , Koraput

Tribals of Koraput, a district in Odisha, may not be able to deliver their complaints and grievances directly to the administration but with the help of community radio jockeys like Julie Sahadev, Bhaktaan Udai, they are definitely heard. Koraput, about 500 kms from Bhubaneswar, may not have many modern facilities, but the tribals there have Dhimsa Community Radio, a dedicated FM radio station to listen to their voice. The first and only community radio in the southern part of Odisha, Dhimsa FM Radio station, established by the UNICEF in collaboration with Southern Odisha Voluntary Organisation (SOVA) in 2012, is now a forum that pays attention to the problems faced by the local people.

Dhimsa's radio jockeys are known in the community for their support through communication. As the local dialect in Koraput is Desia, the villagers found it difficult to understand the government programmes and schemes. Dhimsa Community Radio has solved this problem by delivering these programmes in Desia.

 The founder of Dhimsa radio station and secretary of SOVA, Sanjit Patnaik expressed, "communication is an old trend and community has a practice of listening to radio broadcasts by All India Radio. Going little ahead, Dhimsa Radio provides community members a medium to share their views, raise voices, and present their performances in a format of drama, song and interviews. For the first time tribals experience in the flavor of FM band listening radio programmes in their own dialect especially in the voice of their known community members"

4.Radio Aaykar Gujarat

At a fraction of the cost that the government incurs in disseminating information, community radio Aaykar is both raising the level of

awareness about rights among Gujarat's Dang tribals, which are among the poorest in the country, and, through RTI, uncovering irregularities in the system. Community radio Aaykar (meaning 'listen') is playing the dual role of information-provider and watchdog in the remote region of the Dangs, in Gujarat, where there is no access to television or even a local newspaper. A 30-minute programme, aired every Thursday, both informs and entertains the region's tribals, counted as among the poorest in the country.

Launched in November 2006, with support from the Centre for Social Justice (CSJ), a civil society organisation that runs paralegal centres in rural and tribal districts of Gujarat, Aaykar airs its programmes only in the local Dangi dialect, a mix of Gujarati and Marathi. The programmes are managed entirely by local young people who gather the facts and write their own episodes.

While CSJ provided the technical support, Dristi Media of Ahmedabad and the Kutch Mahila Vikas Sangathan (KMVS) trained local reporters and staff. And the training seems to have paid off. A segment on the programme 'DharaiGyas', which means 'to expose', has already caused quite a stir in the district. Six young reporters from Aaykar are actively using the Right To Information (RTI) Act to monitor implementation of various government schemes and programmes, and whether they can be properly accessed by the beneficiaries. They have also been instrumental in exposing several irregularities and instances of graft by officials.

In December, for example, the reporters focused on land issues, especially the procurement of land-related certificates. Through RTI, they sought information on the official rates for various land certificates and registration of births and deaths.

Through a number of interviews, the reporters uncovered how talatis (panchayat secretaries) were fleecing the poor tribals of Pimpari village by charging as much as Rs 100 for land certificates instead of the official Rs 5. The talatis were also charging people for registering births and deaths when the process is supposed to be free of cost. Likewise,

Aaykar's reporters have exposed corruption in the National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme (NREGS), public distribution system, forest department, and the workings of the panchayat.

Nupur of CSJ says that, at a very low cost, the organisation has managed to effectively raise the level of awareness among people in the region. The government's information department, on the other hand, spends lakhs every year but barely manages to reach out to people who need it the most. Besides investigative reporting the programme devotes time to people's struggles and successes. Aaykar reporter Sunitaben Bagul explains that the idea is to focus on one person every week and report on his/her struggle and achievements. This can be an inspiration for everyone in the district. Aaykar also focuses on local culture, tribal art and music. Since music transcends all barriers, it has proved to be one of the most popular features of the programme, especially among women.

5. Jnan Taranga – Assam

Jnan Taranga is a community radio service having its coverage to 10-15 kms from the location of the station. The community radio service is entertained by the local community people. Jnan Taranga is heard and utilized by different age groups as it contains both educational and community based issues interspersed with entertainment programmes. The community radio station is at present located in Guwahati. The communities served are those based in Dispur, Hatigaon, Kahilipara, Lokhra, Khanapara etc. which comprises Assamese, Nepali, Karbi, Rabha and Hindi speaking communities. The number of users of the community radio service is 8000 approximately. With the availability of Jnan Taranga on internet, it can be accessed globally.

The broadcast schedule of Jnan Taranga comprises mostly community-based programmes. There are programmes on wide ranging subjects like health, sports, career, science, women's issues, children, agriculture, horticulture, folk culture, entrepreneurship etc. North East being a land of more than 357 social groups and ethnic communities, Jnan Taranga has provided a platform to uphold their cultures and tradition.

A programme titled as *Janajiwan*is concentrated on tribal communities. Different tribal groups such as Bodo, Mishing, Rabha, Dewri, Ahom, Karbi etc. used to share this platform to discuss about their festivals, local food, dress, rituals and customs. They have also sung and danced to their folk songs and love to hear their own voices through the community radio station. Most of them requested the radio station to broadcast the same episode for a number of times so as to listen to their songs and discussions on their culture and tradition in a common platform. Jnan Taranga has been trying to develop the social conditions of the tribal communities. As such, the CRS tries to visit such areas where these communities live. In a recent programme, an awareness programme was organised in a Karbi village. A doctor was also accompanied by the CRS. In the programme, the tribal people sang and danced in their folk songs, talked about their tradition and cooked food in their own way for the whole team of the CRS. The doctor provided health, hygiene and sanitation tips to the people and also discussed how to prevent certain diseases.

In another such visit to a tribal village, Jnan Taranga, the CRS took the initiative to train the local people in some skills such as preparing souvenirs from cane and bamboo, pickle and jam making by the housewives, coir and jute products etc. Apart from these skill-based training, they were also trained on how to interact with tourists and make them visit and stay at their places. These are some ways to generate revenue which can help in socio-economic development of the tribal communities residing in the state.

Conclusion

The community radio seems to be one of the easiest to be adopted for communication between tribals, of the tribals and by the tribals. The institutions who obtain the licenses for operating the radio station must be in a position to hand it over to the tribals themselves, and just provide moral and technical support to the station. The radio stations must not use this opportunity of broadcasting 'for' the tribals. The tribal welfare department must identify the educational institutions or good

civil society organisations, orient them and give financial support to run the station. Community Radio will be the tool for communicating in as many tribal languages as possible, making it possible for reduction of inequality vis-a-vis the dominant population. Information is power and the tribals should not be deprived of the same. This is the aim of SDG 10 is to reduce inequality among populations within the overall framework of *'leave no one behind'.*

Article

World Heritage and Indigenous People: Protecting Cultural Diversity and Inter-culturality in the Globalized World

Kishor Kumar Tripathy[1]

Abstract

This paper examines the role of world heritage and indigenous people for protection of cultural diversity and inter-culturality. The key elements of indigeneity are closely associated with the World heritage and sustain the holistic approach to intangibility and associative values. Specific emphasis on indigenous worldview and values for sustainable indigenous development of world heritage settlements, conservation and safeguarding of tangible and intangible cultural heritage are some of the issues focused in the research. Glimpses of some of the World Heritage Sites and indigenous people, i.e. Great Himalayan National Park Conservation Area; Rock Shelters of Bhimbetka World Heritage Site; Kaziranga National Park; Konso Cultural Landscape; Sacred Mijikenda Kaya Forests; and Phong Nha-Ke Bang National Park have been illustrated and it is proposed that indigenous networks provide a common platform to showcase cultural diversity as well as inter-culturality in a globalized world. The paper ends with a reflection on the impact of world heritage

1. Editor, Cultural Informatics, Indira Gandhi National Centre for the Arts, Ministry of Culture, Govt. of India, New Delhi,
    Email- kkumar.aum@gmail.com

on the indigenous people and offers recommendations for dialogue, social inclusion and culture of peace.

Keywords: World Heritage, Indigeneity, Indigenous People, Culture, Cultural Diversity, Globalization, Intercultural Dialogue, Sustainable Development, Peace.

Introduction

The popularity of the notion of world heritage is primarily due to indigenous networks that give them a common platform to showcase cultural diversity as well as inter-culturality in a globalized world. In the contemporary scenario, the term indigeneity (Tumu, 2010) has achieved attention by the global community and has considerable relevance in the global world heritage forum as well. Indigenous people have self-identification at the individual level and are accepted by the community as their members and have strong links to territories and surrounding cultural resources with a distinct cultural, social, economic and political system. Indigeneity has also promoted an indigenous worldview and values, applying them to cultural diversity. The present research makes an attempt to study the key factors responsible for the protection of cultural diversity which may be used as a powerful tool for inter-culturality. Safeguarding of indigenous-good component of world heritage, i.e. socio-cultural values, historic, artistic, educational and sustainable preservation process; world heritage settlements and important economic initiatives, can potentially contribute to conservation of the cultural heritage and community development. In this connection, historic preservation of world heritage, community engagement, capacity building, research, information, communication and international collaboration with a goal of historical and cultural continuity for world heritage and the indigenous identity are some of the important dimensions to consider.

World Heritage: An Assessment

World heritage presents different geographical features, cultural traditions, manners and customs. The significant contribution of world heritage is to encourage cultural identity and cultural integration which

Fig. 1 : Taj Mahal, World Heritage Site, India, Photography by the author

Fig. 2: Gobustan Rock Art site, World Heritage, Photography by the author

can prove to be a definite asset to the cause of humanity. World heritage (fig. 1 and 2) has a good connect with the indigenous people and contributes to the development of community culture- "enduring relationship between a number of world heritage sites and the indigenous peoples that inhabit them. For historical, cultural and practical reasons this is a complex and sensitive matter, but world heritage is devoted to the very fact that it has become a focus of attention and holds great promise for the future." (Rao, 2010) The objective of world heritage is to promote cultural expressions and multiculturalism can play an important role in this regard. It emphasizes that cultural practice is an ethical approach based on the principles of integral unity of all human beings. Unity in diversity, universal friendship and harmony is the supreme doctrine of a multicultural society, which inspires the future of human unity, peace, and prosperity. The human behaviour and manners, ways of communicating with one another, tolerance, secular ideas, spirit of unity, international cooperation, peace, inter-religious harmony etc. are the important components of world heritage. World heritage is not a desirable concept but a practical approach, which should be maintained for the sustenance of human civilization.

Indigenous People and their Culture

Indigenous people and their culture contribute to the development of world culture. There is a string of links to territories and surrounding world heritage sites. As far as the statistical record is concerned, there are five thousand indigenous people (fig 3 and 4) in the world and they

Fig. 3 : Garo Tribe of Meghalaya, India @Story pick

Fig. 4 :Huli, Indonesia and Papua New Guinea, @Jimmy Nelson

represent that many indigenous cultures of the world. (14 January, 2010) This is basically one of the important features related to cultural diversity. They speak more than four thousand of the nearly seven

thousand languages that are still used today. It may be observed, that when the language of a community dies, the sense of community is destroyed. Apart from the great contribution to world culture, indigenous people of the world continue to experience great challenges at the hands of governments, corporations, and non-governmental organizations, lack of respect and resources, loss of identity and loss of traditional knowledge destroyed by the colonizers. (Nair, 2006) Indigenous people of the world cover about twenty per cent of the earth's surface and most of the areas also represent the bio-cultural heritage and ecosystems that house it.

What is Indigeneity?

Indigeneity emphasizes grounding in relations between the "indigenous" and their "others" rather than in properties inherent only to those we call "indigenous" themselves. Indigeneity is taken to imply first-order connections (usually at a small scale) between group and locality and thus it distinguishes "natives" from others.

The key elements of indigeneity are closely associated with the world heritage and sustain the holistic approach to the importance of intangibility and associative values. 'The term *indigenous* has long been used as a designation distinguishing those who are "native" from their "others" in specific locales and with varying scope. In recent decades, this concept has become internationalized, and "indigeneity" has come to also presuppose a sphere of commonality among those who form a world collectivity of "indigenous peoples" in contrast to their various others.(Merlan, 2009)In the contemporary scenario, the term indigeneity has achieved attention by the global community and has considerable relevance in the global world heritage forum as well. In the Indigeneity community, there were considerable historical similarities of settlement, colonization and marginalization of native peoples.

Indigeneity, Indigenous People and World Heritage: An Assessment

The UN Draft Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (September 13, 2007), and Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 1947, give special emphasis on the rights of indigenous people such as (1) self-determination; (2) lands, territories, and resources; (3) international

peace and cooperation; (4) cultural, political, and social rights; (5) relocation and occupation; and (6) treaties. (September 13, 2007) Indigenous people have self-identification at the individual level and accepted by the community as their member and have strong links to territories and surrounding cultural resources and distinct cultural, social, economic and political system.(Nair, 2006) In earlier times the term indigenous has long been used as "Native" to distinguish from others, but in the recent decades "Indigeneity" has been internationalized. Indigenous people are considered as the bearer of their traditional knowledge, values which are related to their ancestral land, particularly to the world heritage sites. In 2007 the World Heritage Committee recognized '… the critical importance of involving indigenous, traditional and local communities in the implementation of the Convention, [and] further decides to add "Communities" as a fifth Strategic Objective' alongside the other four pillars of World Heritage: Credibility, Conservation, Capacity building, Communication.' The indigenous knowledge system provides valuable information to other groups of indigenous people concerned with heritage and cultural properties, that are part of world heritage.

Glimpses of some of the World Heritage Sites and Indigenous People

The world heritage programme of UNESCO (www.en.unesco.org) concerns about the protection and preservation of world heritage and associated systems, include knowledge system, belief and customs. There are several world heritage sites in India and different parts of the world, where one can see the glimpses of the world heritage as well as the indigenous community. In this paper, the following world heritage sites and involvement of the indigenous community and their practices will be discussed.

- Great Himalayan National Park Conservation Area, India
- Rock Shelters of Bhimbetka, Madhya Pradesh, India
- Kaziranga National Park, Assam, India,
- Konso Cultural Landscape, (Ethiopia),
- Sacred Mijikenda Kaya Forests Kenya

Fig. .5: Great Himalayan National Park Conservation Area @ IUCN Graaeme Worboys

-        Phong Nha-Ke Bang National Park, World Heritage Site, Vietnam

The Great Himalayan National Park Conservation Area (fig.5) World Heritage Site, is situated at the western part of the Himalayan Mountain, Himachal Pradesh. In this area, high alpine peaks, alpine meadows and river forests exist and it represents part of the Himalayan biodiversity hotspot. This heritage site is also having rich assemblage of fauna species, several of which are threatened and it represents twenty-five forest types. In this heritage site, we find the existence of traditional cattle rearing communities, those who contribute natural resources for livestock grazing, foodstuff, medicinal use of the plants and game hunting.

Rock Shelters of Bhimbetka (World Heritage Site, Madhya Pradesh, India) presents an authentic symbolic corpus of very different societies

and forms of expressions, interrelationship with religion, myth, art, science and language and the concept of reality. In this site, we find the existence of Gond (fig.6) community. The Gonds celebrate most festive occasions with song and dance and particularly the hereditary bards and professional storytellers (Pradhanas) tell the interesting stories about

Fig. 6. : Gond tribe of Madhya Pradesh, @Story pick

the Gond legends. This represents the rich oral tradition of the community.

Kaziranga National Park, World Heritage, Assam, India, also famous for natural resources and in this area, the indigenous, Mikir tribes giving the visitor a chance to experience tradition and culture of the region.

Konso Cultural Landscape, (World Heritage site, Ethiopia), is famous for stone walled terraces and fortified settlements and the living ,cultural tradition stretching back twenty one generations. Stone steles in the towns express a complex system of marking the passing of generations of leaders and features anthropomorphic wooden statues. The indigenous people demonstrate the shared values, social cohesion and engineering knowledge of their communities.

Fig. 7 : Phong Nha-Ke Bang National Park, Vietnam- © Vincent Ko Hon Chiu

Sacred Mijikenda Kaya Forests (World Heritage site, Kenya) comprise ten separate sites and it is believed the indigenous people, i.e Mijikendra migrated in 16th century. The site is considered as the abode of ancestors, repositories of spiritual beliefs and places of ritual.

Phong Nha-Ke Bang National Park, (fig.7) (World Heritage Site, Vietnam) is formed by limestone plateaux and tropical forests. It features great geological diversity and offers spectacular phenomena, including a large number of caves and underground rivers. The indigenous Ruc tribe considered as the ethnic community and art of basketry is very famous in this region. These are examples of some of the world heritage sites and contribution of the indigenous people for protection of the values, which leads to cultural diversity and Interculturality.

Indigenous people are considered as the bearer of their traditional knowledge, values which are related to their ancestral land, particularly to the world heritage sites. Specific knowledge practices of some of the communities are included in the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity, such as tradition of Vedic chanting (India); Woodcrafting knowledge of the Zafimaniry (Madagascar); Koogere oral tradition of the Basongora, Banyabindi and Batooro peoples (Uganda), Traditional knowledge and technologies relating to the growing and processing of the curagua, (Venezuela); Ebru, Turkish art of marbling Inscribed in 2014, (Turkey); Washi, craftsmanship of traditional Japanese hand-made paper (Japan); and Art of ĐÝn ca tài tí music and song (Vietnam) etc. Indigenous people are the traditional owners and guardians of their holistic knowledge, traditional and cultural values.

Therefore, the relationship between world heritage sites and the indigenous people is integral.

Indigenous People, World Heritage and Community Culture

When we talk about world heritage and indigenous people, some of the specific issues, i.e world heritage status, their indivisible combination of cultural and natural heritage, and their inherent spiritual significance to an indigenous people or peoples associated with them etc. need to be addressed. Indigenous people are the traditional owners and

guardians of their holistic knowledge, traditional and cultural values. (Oviedo, 2010) The world culture throughout the centuries has left many legacies and immortal gift to the modern world. Collectively the rich diversity of the cultural heritage contributes a unique wealth to world heritage. Tangible heritage represents itself in a material form, like archaeology, art objects, monuments, landscapes, historical sites and heritage compounds. Intangible heritage represents the cultural wealth of a given society. Tangible and intangible cultural heritage plays an important role in world heritage practices both traditional and contemporary. It has also contributed for globalization process, economic growth and promotion of sustainable tourism. Indigenous worldview nourishes human values which is also the chief cause for the development of community culture and world heritage development. Community culture is a unique concept, which deals with cultural diversity. Dialogue between indigenous people and the world heritage respects and values diversity and creates an integral approach for the development of world culture.

World Heritage Settlements, Conservation and Safeguarding of Tangible and Intangible Culture

The two important factors of world heritage, i.e. Tangible and Intangible cultural heritage play an important role for sustainable development of world culture. Tumu et. al. (2010), says "identification, management and successful conservation of heritage must be pursued with the meaningful involvement of human communities and the reconciliation of conflicting interests, but should not be achieved against the interests or through the exclusion of local communities." Therefore, tangible and intangible heritage should be preserved for a better understanding of the indigenous culture.

Following are some of the action plans which may be considered in this regard:

1.   Safeguarding of tangible and intangible cultural heritage could be best implemented by recognizing the existence of indigenous people of these sites.

2.   World heritage settlements and safeguarding of public-good component of world heritage, i.e. socio-cultural values, historic, artistic, educational and sustainable preservation process.

3.   Historic preservation of world heritage, larger rehabilitation process, effective conservation strategy and heritage development.

4.   Implementation of innovative information technology and sustainable planning, design and practices.

5.   Preservation and safeguarding of tangible and intangible heritage through collaborative efforts of federal government and the citizens, which will make the heritage coherent and relevant.

6.   World heritage conservation strategies, sustainable development and action-oriented quality of human environment.

7.   Community engagement, capacity building, research, information, communication and international collaboration with a goal of historical and cultural continuity for creative evolution of culture in urban development.

Conservation and safeguarding of the world heritage create an environment demonstrating the capacity, knowledge, understanding and skills to communicate effectively with culturally diverse people.

Indigenous Worldview and Values, Sustainable Development of World Heritage: Intercultural Dialogue for Promotion of Tolerance and Understanding

The objective of indigenous worldview is to promote dialogue between world heritage and indigenous people and can play an important role for creating world peace. Unity in diversity, universal friendship and harmony is the supreme doctrine of a society based on indigenous ideals, which inspires for the future of human unity, peace, and prosperity. (Merlan, 2009) The feature of indigenous world view is to address issues of diversity and it flourishes democracy, tolerance, social justice, peace and mutual respect between peoples and cultures. Intercultural dialogue in twenty-first century is a positive approach which aims to create a better world based on unity in diversity, peace, harmony and co-operation. It has a definite role to build a bridge between the world

civilizations and the modern nations in the twenty-first century. It can also be understood that direct involvement of indigenous peoples in the conservation and protection of natural and cultural heritage, will contribute to the spiritual, intellectual, social recovery of traditional local communities.

In the age of globalization, action plan development for promotion of understanding between world heritage and indigenous people is an important area, where special emphasis should be given on active consultative mechanisms to involve people from diverse linguistic and cultural backgrounds.

There is a need for development and implementation of policies, network relationships with ethnic community groups and individual recognition of understanding, community engagement, identification and consultation with indigenous community and promotion of strategies.

Therefore, effective consultation, co-operation and involvement of Indigenous peoples and traditional local communities in the management of their ancestral territories will be a powerful tool for protection of the world heritage.

Conclusion and Recommendations

Issues on world heritage and indigenous people have considered as an important factor of development of world heritage. According to the Report of "UNESCO's contribution to the International Decade of the World's Indigenous People (1995-2004), Hundred and sixty-second Session, United Nations launched its initial official activities concerning indigenous people in 1982. The year 1993 was recognized as the **International Year of the World's Indigenous People.** In this process, **International Decade of the World's Indigenous People** was duly proclaimed by the **General Assembly** in its resolution 48/163 of 21 December 1993 on the theme "Indigenous people: partnership in action (1995-2004) and second International Decade of the World's Indigenous People was declared from 2005-2014. (February 2014) Also, every year, 9 August is commemorated as the **International Day of the World's Indigenous Peoples** by **UN.** In this regard, indigenous

network between world heritage and indigenous people can be an important tool for settlement of culture of peace. Indigenous network helps to communicate and interact effectively and positively with diverse individuals, cultural practice and beliefs in a diverse society, which will definitely create a peaceful and cooperative society. Keeping this in view, culture of peace may be established through diverse tradition based on understanding of man, nature and the universe, in experience and practice, by which global peace and harmony can be created in the modern world. Indigenous world view is worth applicable for the realization of human values and to interact with cultural traditions, which will not only build the bridge between world cultures in twenty-first century, but also will bring global peace and harmony for the peaceful coexistence of the human civilization. The paper ends with a reflection on the impact of world heritage on the Indigenous people and offers following recommendations for dialogue, social inclusion and culture of peace.

- Encouragement of interactions and exchanges among all indigenous people, inter alia, intellectuals, thinkers and artists of various societies and civilizations.

- Improvement of indigenous relations with a view to improve management of diversity and enhance social cohesion.

- Development and implementation of policies with special emphasis on inclusive policies, programs and services which are responsive to cultural and linguistic differences.

- Recognition of understanding that indigenous dialogue reflects the cultural and racial diversity of diverse societies and acknowledges the freedom of all members to preserve, enhance and share their cultural heritage.

- Identification and consultation with indigenous community agencies and networks to implement policies in the objective to face current issues related to world heritage development.

- Promotion of strategies that indigenous dialogue is a fundamental characteristic of the heritage and identity and it provides an invaluable resource in the shaping of the future of the world.

References

Heuheu, Tumu et. al. (2010), "The concept of Indigeneity has been gaining attention in recent years in many international and national forums and it holds considerable relevance in the global World Heritage forum." World Heritage and Indigeneity, p. 10

Rao, Kishor (2010) *World Heritage and Indigenous Peoples,* Director, UNESCO World Heritage Centre.

Nair, Manjusha S. (2006), "Indigenous communities, which are inherently linked to the process of modernization, are placed outside the sphere of modernization." Defining Indigeneity: Situating Transnational Knowledge, World Society Focus Paper Series A series edited by the World Society Foundation, Zurich, p.5.

Merlan, Francesca (2009) Indigeneity: Global and Local, *Current Anthropology,* 50, (3), pp. 303.

Nair, Manjusha S. (2006), Defining Indigeneity: Situating Transnational Knowledge, World Society Focus Paper Series A series edited by the World Society Foundation, Zurich, p.5. "Indigenous ways of life, art forms, food-habits, industries, all become markers of a traditional world that is free from the perils of modernization." p.5

Oviedo, Gonzalo (2010) *Traditional knowledge, the Convention on Biological Diversity and World Heritage*, p.64

Heuheu, Tumu et. al. (2010), World Heritage and Indigeneity. *World Heritage*. p. 10

Merlan, F. (2009). Indigeneity: Global and local. Current anthropology, 50(3), 303-333.